

**TRADITIONAL APPRENTICESHIP  
PRACTICE IN DAR ES SALAAM:  
A STUDY**

**Prepared for VETA and GTZ  
Tanzania**

**by  
Nell and Shapiro cc**

**September/October 1999**

*Nell and Shapiro cc  
139 Third Avenue  
2094 BEZ VALLEY  
South Africa*

*Tel: +27 11 648-4107  
Fax: +27 11 648-4828*

*New contact details from December 15 1999:*

*27 Eighth Street  
2196 PARKMORE  
Sandton  
South Africa*

*Tel: + 27 11 883-6847  
883-2465  
784-1705*

**Traditional Apprenticeship Practice in Dar Es Salaam: A Study (1999)**

## **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

The purpose of this study was to contribute to VETA's efforts to find out more about the informal sector in Tanzania, in particular the traditional practice of apprenticeship in Dar es Salaam. A survey was conducted in Dar es Salaam during September 1999, focusing specifically on eight trades, four of which were traditionally seen as male dominated and four female dominated. The trades were: masonry, catering, car mechanics, welding, carpentry, hairdressing, child care and tailoring. A total of 330 informal sector enterprises were included in the survey. Of these, 194 had had apprentices over the past five years. The total number of apprentices employed by them in that period was 1 350. Only enterprise owners or managers were interviewed.

Questions were asked relating to the gender, age and education levels of respondents and owners generally, as well as about the welfare of the businesses, and the problems confronted by owners and managers. Key problems were identified as finding a plot, licencing and registration, financing and marketing. The development of skills and know-how was ranked low as a priority.

The study found that the practice of traditional apprenticeship is widespread, but relatively rudimentary, in these trades in Dar es Salaam. Written agreements between enterprises and apprentices are rare, and the practice does not seem to be demand-driven. Those businesses that feel there is not enough demand for their goods or services are as likely to take on apprentices as those that do feel there is a demand for their goods and services. A relatively high number of apprentices do seem to go on to self-employment (28.5%) without any further training intervention. Nevertheless, the quality of goods and services and levels of productivity in the enterprises is, on the whole, low.

Although owners and managers do not prioritise training, they do identify a range of needs, both in terms of developing craft or trade skills, and business skills. In a number of instances, they say they are teaching apprentices skills which they do not believe they have themselves. Where they have skills, these were almost exclusively obtained through an informal apprenticeship or on-the-job training in an informal environment. Because of the low levels of development of formal industry in Tanzania, the kind of learning exchange between the formal and informal sectors which happens in some other countries (e.g. learning a skill in a formal setting and then using it as the basis for setting up an informal business), does not appear to take place.

Despite the attempt to balance traditionally male-dominated and female-dominated trades, women were found to be more likely to be employees than employers, and less likely to benefit from an apprenticeship, in almost all the trades, except hairdressing. The traditionally male-dominated trades were, on the whole, far more likely, to take on apprentices, and male graduates were more likely to set up in their own businesses than female graduates.

**Traditional Apprenticeship Practice in Dar Es Salaam: A Study (1999)**

Some of the trades had very few apprentices (child care, in particular), and in some which did have large numbers (tailoring, in particular) the practice seemed to be diminishing.

We concluded that the practice of traditional apprenticeship in Dar es Salaam, while prevalent, is not robust, and does not currently lend itself to external interference. We suggest, instead, a more multi-pronged VET approach which focuses on encouraging excellence at the “master” level.

## **PREFACE**

It was a privilege for me to work with the committed staff of GTZ and VETA in Dar es Salaam. They generously shared with me their considerable knowledge and experience of Tanzania, and made me feel welcome and supported through what proved to be a fairly arduous task.

In particular, I would like to thank Mr Ewald Gold, the GTZ Advisor, and Dr Susanna Adam, a GTZ Consultant, without whom the surveying process would not have been possible. Their support in developing the questionnaire and organising the interviewers was invaluable. Dr Adam participated actively in the survey process and it is largely thanks to her that it went off relatively smoothly. Her knowledge and insights also made an enormous contribution to my own understanding.

Mrs Ndunguru, Director of Training for VETA, also made an important contribution, particularly in her ideas to ensure that the questionnaire and interviewing process were sensitive to gender issues. Mr Gilbert Kabwogi of VETA was indefatigable in his support to the process, doing translations, meeting with the interviewers, providing insights from his own experience, checking on the interviewing process, and escorting me on visits to informal sector enterprises. I would not have managed without him. The nine interviewers all did a sterling job and deserve to be thanked by name: Valentina Baltazar, Paul Bwathondi, Edson Eliah, Maduhu Kazi, Nyangee Lugoe, Wilfred Massawe, Rehema Moyo, Joseph Njau, and Rodrick Stanley.

While there are both successes and failures in the informal sector, what does emerge is a picture of people determined not to let extreme poverty and difficult circumstances grind them into the ground. It is in the market places, on the pavements, in the backyards and under the trees that one finds the heart of a city, and sees the face of its courage.

In all, I enjoyed my stay in Tanzania very much, and it is my hope that this report will make a useful contribution in assisting VETA to develop a strategy that can contribute significantly to the development of the informal sector in that beautiful country.

**Marian Nell**  
**Johannesburg**  
**October 1999**

**Traditional Apprenticeship Practice in Dar Es Salaam: A Study (1999)**

# CONTENTS

	Page
<b>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY</b>	i
<b>PREFACE</b>	iii
<b>CONTENTS</b>	iv
<b>LIST OF TABLES</b>	vi
<b>ACRONYMS</b>	viii
<b>CURRENCY</b>	viii
<b>SECTION 1: INTRODUCTION</b>	1
<b>.1 Why a Study on Traditional Apprenticeship Practice         in Dar es Salaam?</b>	1
<b>1.2 Some Background to the Tanzanian Economy and the         Role of VET</b>	4
<b>1.3 The City of Dar es Salaam</b>	6
<b>SECTION 2: THE METHODOLOGY USED</b>	7
<b>2.1 Terminology Used</b>	7
<b>2.2 Trades Selected</b>	7
<b>2.3 The Questionnaire</b>	11
<b>2.4 The Interviewers and Interviewing Process</b>	11
<b>SECTION 3: PROFILE OF THE SAMPLE SURVEYED</b>	14
<b>3.1 Who are the Owners and Managers?</b>	14
<b>3.2 Profile of the Businesses in the Survey</b>	19
<b>3.3 Summary</b>	31
<b>SECTION 4: TRADITIONAL APPRENTICESHIP PRACTICE</b>	32
<b>4.1 Prevalence of the Practice</b>	32
<b>4.2 Profile of the Apprentices</b>	34
<b>4.3 The Apprenticeship Relationship</b>	36
<b>4.4 Ending Apprenticeship and Life after Apprenticeship</b>	45
<b>4.5 Summary</b>	50

	<b>Page</b>
<b>SECTION 5: ATTITUDE OF ENTERPRISE OWNERS TO TRAINING</b>	<b>52</b>
5.1 Training Needs	52
5.2 Ability and Willingness to Pay for Training	58
5.3 Summary	59
<b>SECTION 6: CONCLUSIONS</b>	<b>60</b>
6.1 Introduction	60
6.2 Findings	60
6.3 Conclusions	63
<b>SECTION 7: WHERE TO?</b>	<b>64</b>
<b>BIBLIOGRAPHY</b>	<b>67</b>
<b>APPENDICES</b>	
1 Terms of Reference	
2 Questionnaire in English	
3 Questionnaire in KiSwahili	

## LIST OF TABLES

	Page
<b>SECTION 3: PROFILE OF THE SAMPLE SURVEYED</b>	<b>14</b>
Table 3.1: Status of Respondent by Trade	14
Table 3.2: Owners by Trade and Gender	15
Table 3.3: Age of Respondents	16
Table 3.4: Age of Respondents by Trade	16
Table 3.5: Educational Levels of Respondents	17
Table 3.6: Educational Level by Trade	17
Table 3.7: Educational Level by Length of Time the Business Has been in Existence	18
Table 3.8: Length of Time Businesses Operating	19
Table 3.9: Length of Time in Business by Trade	19
Table 3.10: Comparison of Number of Employees over Two Year Period	20
Table 3.11: Comparison of Number of Employees over Two Year Period by Trade	20
Table 3.12: Business Expansion	21
Table 3.13: Business Expansion by Trade	21
Table 3.14: Demand for Products and Services	22
Table 3.15: Demand for Products and Services by Trade	22
Table 3.16: Problems Experienced Initially in Setting up Business	23
Table 3.17: Problems Experienced by Businesses Currently	24
Table 3.18: Problems By Trade	
a    Masons	25
b    Caterers	26
c    Tailors	26
d    Welders	27
e    Mechanics	27
f    Carpenters	28
g    Child carers	28
h    Hairdressers	29
Table 3.19: Access to Infrastructure by Trade	29
Table 3.20: Interviewer Confidence Ratings	30
<b>SECTION 4: TRADITIONAL APPRENTICESHIP PRACTICE</b>	<b>32</b>
Table 4.1: Number of Businesses Currently with Apprentices by Trade	32
Table 4.2: Number of Apprentices Currently by Trade	33
Table 4.3: Number of Apprentices over 5 Years by Trade	34



	<b>Page</b>
<b>Table 4.4: Number of Apprentices over 5 Years by Trade and Gender</b>	<b>35</b>
<b>Table 4.5: Age of Apprentices</b>	<b>36</b>
<b>Table 4.6: Age of Current Apprentices by Trade and Age</b>	<b>36</b>
<b>Table 4.7: Reasons for Taking Apprentices</b>	<b>37</b>
<b>Table 4.8: Reasons for Taking Apprentices by Trade</b>	<b>37</b>
<b>Table 4.9: Important Factors in Apprentice Selection</b>	<b>38</b>
<b>Table 4.10: Important Factors in Apprentice Selection by Trade</b>	<b>39</b>
<b>Table 4.11: Reasons for Not Taking Apprentices</b>	<b>40</b>
<b>Table 4.12: Reasons for Not Taking Apprentices by Trade</b>	<b>40</b>
<b>Table 4.13: Form of Agreement</b>	<b>41</b>
<b>Table 4.14: Form of Agreement by Trade</b>	<b>41</b>
<b>Table 4.15: Contributions made by Apprentices</b>	<b>42</b>
<b>Table 4.16: Contributions of Apprentices by Trade</b>	<b>42</b>
<b>Table 4.17: Contribution of Business to Apprentice</b>	<b>43</b>
<b>Table 4.18: Contribution of Business to Apprentice by Trade</b>	<b>43</b>
<b>Table 4.19: Other Items in Agreements</b>	<b>44</b>
<b>Table 4.20: Current Status of All Apprentices by Gender</b>	<b>45</b>
<b>Table 4.21: Current Status of all Apprentices who have Completed their Apprenticeship by Gender</b>	<b>45</b>
<b>Table 4.22: Current Status of Former Apprentices by Trade</b>	<b>46</b>
<b>Table 4.23: Average Length of Apprenticeship</b>	<b>48</b>
<b>Table 4.24: Time Needed to Work Independently (“master” assessment)</b>	<b>48</b>
<b>Table 4.25: Average Length of Apprenticeship by Trade</b>	<b>49</b>
<b>Table 4.26: Mark of Completion</b>	<b>50</b>
 <b>SECTION 5: ATTITUDE OF ENTERPRISE OWNERS TO TRAINING</b>	 <b>52</b>
 <b>Table 5.1: Rating of Importance of Skills and Self-Assessment of Skills of Owner/Managers</b>	 <b>52</b>
<b>Table 5.2: Source of Skill Acquisition</b>	<b>53</b>
<b>Table 5.3: Areas Needing Improvement or More Learning (Respondents)</b>	<b>55</b>
<b>Table 5.4: Reasons for Not Undertaking Training</b>	<b>55</b>
<b>Table 5.5: Training Needs of Respondents by Trade</b>	<b>56</b>
<b>Table 5.6: Areas Needing Improvement or More Learning (Apprentices)</b>	<b>57</b>
<b>Table 5.7: Analysis of Apprentice Training Needs by Trade</b>	<b>57</b>
<b>Table 5.8: Analysis of Owner/Manager and Apprentice Needs for Improvement of Skills</b>	<b>58</b>

## ACRONYMS

EO	Enterprise Owner
GTZ	Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit
ISTARN	Informal Sector Training and Resource Network
TAP	Traditional Apprenticeship Programme
Tsh	Tanzanian Shillings
VET	Vocational Education and Training
VETA	Vocational Education and Training Authority

## CURRENCY

1 US\$	=	805 Tsh
1 DM	=	440 Tsh

## SECTION 1: INTRODUCTION

### .1 WHY A STUDY ON TRADITIONAL APPRENTICESHIP PRACTICE IN DAR ES SALAAM?

This study was commissioned by the Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit (GTZ), which is one of the funding arms of the German government, and the Tanzanian Vocational Education and Training Authority (VETA), which is supported by GTZ. VETA emerged from the previous National Vocational Training Division of the Ministry of Labour and Youth Development. It is an autonomous entity governed by a tripartite board. It was set up in terms of the 1994 Vocational Education and Training Act and is attempting to transform itself from a centralised government department to an autonomous and decentralised authority with increased responsibilities. VETA has a twofold role: it both provides training, and regulates the provision of services by other providers. It is funded by a levy which is set at 2% of the wage bill of enterprises with four or more employees. VETA is charged with ensuring that Vocational Education and Training (VET) is demand-oriented, cost-effective, decentralised and fosters entrepreneurial values and skills.

Currently, in many developing countries, and certainly in many sub-Saharan African countries, VET is in a state of crisis. It is generally held to be failing to respond to the needs of rapidly changing labour markets, and studies have shown that graduates of the formal vocational training centres which have largely been charged with providing VET in the past, are not finding jobs.<sup>1</sup> John Grierson, an expert on training in the informal sector, talks about the crises of relevance, equity and cost.<sup>2</sup> By the crisis of relevance, he means a mismatch between the kind of training offered and that needed; by the crisis of equity, he means the existence of barriers to entry into such training, in the form of particular educational qualifications; and, by the crisis of cost, he refers to the high cost of training students in institutions which support extensive infrastructural investment and lengthy courses. Whereas such formal institutions, characterised by relatively inflexible curricula and infrastructure, may have been appropriate when the formal sector of the economy was able to absorb the majority of new workseekers on an annual basis, and in predictable jobs, they no longer meet the needs of a labour market which relies more and more on the so-called informal sector to absorb workseekers.

Over the past fifteen years, as economic structural adjustment programmes began to take a toll, the informal sector has increasingly been seen as a safety net to absorb the growing numbers of those who cannot find employment in the formal sector of

---

<sup>1</sup>So, for example, a tracer study done on 1995 graduates of the Engineering Division of the Masvingo Technical College, in Zimbabwe, found that only 32.4% had found formal employment a year later.

<sup>2</sup>Grierson (1997).

the economy.<sup>3</sup> The World Bank estimates that the informal sector comprises up to 60% of the labour force in the urban areas of many sub-Saharan African countries. By the year 2020 this could rise to 95% in some parts of Africa.<sup>4</sup> Governments in these countries have come to rely on the informal sector to act as a sponge for the growing numbers of unemployed and underemployed. So, for example, the Ministry of Labour and Youth Development in Tanzania noted, in 1997, that it believed that the informal sector could employ 62.5% of the yearly increase in the labour force in urban areas, whereas the formal sector could only employ 8.5%.<sup>5</sup> Despite the high hopes that governments have of the informal sector, and rhetoric which extols the opportunities it offers, the regulatory framework often hinders, rather than assists, informal sector enterprise owners. So, for example, in Tanzania, restrictive license distribution (all businesses must be licensed or face the possibility of being bulldozed out of existence) is in stark contrast to government rhetoric which encourages young people to set up their own businesses. As Adam notes:

*Even informal sector training programmes may be in vain as long as government authorities continue to demolish roadside work places.*

Informal sector businesses are also plagued by high levels of corruption among public officials which drain the small profits they may make.

A recent project progress review of the GTZ/VETA work<sup>6</sup> noted:

*As far as the systems VET offers are concerned, employment relevance should be decisive, including gainful employment opportunities in all*

---

<sup>3</sup>The informal sector is a term used to describe that sector of the economy which comprises informal own-account entrepreneurs, as well paid employees of these entrepreneurs, apprentices and family helpers. International definitions usually limit the size of an informal sector enterprise to five employees or fewer, with the exception of manufacturing and construction enterprises where the maximum number can be as high as 10 paid employees. (Adam 1998) Matsebula (1996) lists a whole range of additional criteria which define an informal sector business, including:

- .1 Ease of entry
- .2 Low division of labour
- .3 Low capital intensity
- .4 Flexibility in hours of operation
- .5 Low income
- .6 Reliance on indigenous resources
- .7 Informal acquisition of skills
- .8 Low use for formal credit.

<sup>4</sup>This analysis is taken from a World Bank Policy Paper(1991).

<sup>5</sup>Adam (1998).

<sup>6</sup>Manyanza, Reuber and Sander (May 1999).

*economic sectors. It is therefore not only necessary to constantly update training for the modern sector, but to also develop strategies, which empower VETA, through activities in the training area, to foster sustainable employment also in the informal sector.*

Traditionally, VETA caters mainly (almost exclusively) for the formal sector and has only taken the needs of the informal sector into account to a very limited extent. Its expanded mandate, with an emphasis on training demand and entrepreneurial values and skills, clearly calls for it to look more seriously at the informal sector.

In other parts of sub-Saharan Africa, most notably in Zimbabwe<sup>7</sup>, GTZ has been involved in projects which seek to build on the traditional apprenticeship practice in order to add training value in the informal sector. Traditionally, in many parts of the world, small enterprises sold training as well as products. Apprentices paid masters a fee, in cash or labour, in return for instruction in a trade. This tradition continues in many parts of Africa to this day. A survey done of the Dar es Salaam informal sector in 1995<sup>8</sup> identified about 8 200 apprentices. Through apprenticeship, individuals can acquire the broad range of practical and business skills necessary for employment. In the traditional practice, however, training is all “hands-on” and no formal instruction is given. The traditional practice has the advantages of providing a demand-driven, relevant, low cost and equitable training entry to employment and, more importantly, self-employment opportunities in the informal sector.

The practice has, however, been criticised because it does not encourage innovation, because training is haphazard and may not be adequate, and because the product or service that results may not be of a high standard.<sup>9</sup> Programmes such as the ISTARN Traditional Apprenticeship Programme (TAP) in Zimbabwe, seek, partly at least, through “inserting” a very short period of formal training into the traditional practice, to add value to the traditional practice without interfering with it to an extent which may destroy it. It is still too soon to say whether the ISTARN TAP has successfully negotiated this challenge. There are reports from fieldworkers that some enterprise owners who have taken on “ISTARN apprentices” are now saying that they are not prepared to take on apprentices who do not go through the ISTARN

---

<sup>7</sup>This refers specifically to the ISTARN Traditional Apprenticeship Programme which was piloted in Masvingo and is now being replicated in Mutare, Zimbabwe.

<sup>8</sup>Used by Adam (ibid).

<sup>9</sup>Adam (ibid) quotes a study of skill acquisition in informal sector enterprises in Dar es Salaam as saying that the informal apprenticeship practice has enormous drop-out rates, sometimes as high as 65%. This is attributed to the low teaching ability of the operators, long working hours, accidents, and non-provision of food and cash. She also notes that many of the businesses are of a seasonal nature, and that operators cannot afford to keep on apprentices during low-income periods. In addition, enterprise owners themselves often lack technical skills, tools and materials, and productivity is low. There is also the possibility that apprentices are not so much “dropping out” as moving to new sites of training as they master the limited learnings available at a particular enterprise.

process. This raises concerns about the long-term impact of the intervention on the traditional practice.

Be that as it may, traditional apprenticeship is recognised as an important vehicle for vocational training in the informal sector, and programmes that use a traditional apprenticeship approach are seen as a legitimate form of VET in the sector. The GTZ/VETA study of traditional apprenticeship practice in Dar es Salaam is, thus, an exploratory process to assess the suitability of a programme based on the traditional practice in the Tanzanian context. It seeks to answer the questions:

*How does the traditional practice operate in Dar es Salaam?*

*Is there any useful way for VETA to get involved in adding value to the practice?*

It is important, however, to keep in mind that the GTZ/VETA initiative is based on an approach to supporting the informal sector which is grounded in offering some form of training. It, thus, limits the range of possible interventions that institutions may offer to those that provide training. The informal sector, however, demands a more complex and multi-faceted response to its needs. The ISTARN experience has shown, for example, that the option to participate in a tool hire-to-buy scheme at the end of the apprenticeship period is at least as important to the future success of the TAP graduates as the short period of formal training. Adam, quoted above, has noted the importance of changing the regulatory framework. Mjema (1999) also points to the lack of credit facilities and business advisory skills.

Increasingly, institutions such as VETA are coming to understand that the success of VET needs to be determined not so much by the number of people who get trained, no matter how high the quality of the training, but by the number of graduates who get employed, whether this takes the form of wage employment or self-employment. It is important not to lose sight of this understanding in exploring the potential of a possible traditional apprenticeship programme in Dar es Salaam.

## **1.2 SOME BACKGROUND TO THE TANZANIAN ECONOMY AND THE ROLE OF VET<sup>10</sup>**

Tanzania is rated as one of the five poorest countries in the world. It has a total population of 27 million, 46% of whom are under 15. Population growth is 2.8% per annum. The transformation of the Tanzanian economy from a state-planned to a market-oriented economy is still under way. In response to the deep structural reforms, economic growth in Tanzania has recovered to about 5% per annum. Growth has been led by agriculture, which accounts for about 50% of GDP and employs approximately 80% of the workforce. Urbanisation is, however, accelerating and the population of Dar es Salaam, already between two and three million, is

---

<sup>10</sup>We are indebted, for the information in this section, to Dr Susanna Adam's study on VET and the informal sector (1998) and Manyanza, Reuber and Sander (1999).

expected to double by 2008. While services (33% of GDP) have also recovered, the industrial sector (18%) is only slowly starting to grow. Expanding sectors include tourism, mining, food processing and beverages. Employment has been growing at more than 3% per annum during the past two decades. Unfortunately, however, the labour force is growing faster than this. In addition to those already unemployed, it is estimated that 600 000 to 700 000 youths are entering the labour market every year, requiring an annual growth rate of more than 7% just to maintain the current unemployment level.

From having one of the highest primary school attendance rates during the seventies and eighties, Tanzania now has one of the lowest in Africa. Net enrolment for primary schools has dropped to 56.7%, although it is higher in Dar es Salaam (69%). Very few young people continue beyond the compulsory seven years, and considerably more of these are boys than girls. While the Bureau of Statistics predicted a literacy rate as high as 90% in 1998, informed opinion is that, given the relatively high level of non-enrolment, the relatively high number of drop-outs, and the standard of teaching, illiteracy is far more prevalent than official statistics indicate. Thus, in general, the level of education in the workforce is low. In Dar es Salaam, 6% of women informal sector enterprise owners and 12% of men have not finished primary school, and 24% of women, and 8% of men, have never been to school at all.<sup>11</sup> Because it does not have a well established industrial tradition, the Tanzanian formal sector has not provided the informal sector with a core of skilled or semi-skilled labourers.

Existing VET capacity is supply-driven, emphasising engineering-oriented trades, and with very little integration of entrepreneurship training. It is also largely centre-based, and was designed, implemented and evaluated without the active participation of employers. VETA is trying to address these problems. After one or two years of basic training in an institution, students are expected to do practical training in companies (formal apprenticeships). In reality, very few find places after their basic centre-based training, although many attend evening classes and take trade tests. They end up certificated but with little or no workplace exposure. This may be why the existing VET capacity is under-utilised, and is related directly to what Grierson refers to as the “crisis of relevance”. In all, just over eight percent of the labour force has received any formal training, and this percentage goes down to 3.8% among women.

Adam (ibid) notes that, in the current climate, the greatest need is for training in skills that will enhance the chance of individuals to gain employment and supplement their income. Non-formal training in the informal sector aims to achieve this, but it needs to be demand-driven, flexible in terms of where it takes place, how it takes place, and what it covers<sup>12</sup>, adapted to local conditions and requirements, cheap and

---

<sup>11</sup>VETA (1999).

<sup>12</sup>Training for the informal sector needs to be flexible enough to respond to the identification of market niches and of saturation trends.

accessible to those with very limited levels of education.<sup>13</sup> Informal does not necessarily mean poor quality. However, many of the goods available in the informal sector in Tanzania are not of good quality, and this too must be kept in mind in looking at the appropriateness of an intervention in the traditional apprenticeship practice.

### 1.3 THE CITY OF DAR ES SALAAM<sup>14</sup>

Dar es Salaam is the largest city in Tanzania and also the economic, cultural, educational and even political centre of the country, despite the official capital being Dodoma. It measures about 1 400 square kilometres and is divided into three main districts: Temeke, Kinondoni and Ilala. The city offers good trading conditions with a large harbour, and extensive railway and road networks, which connect Dar es Salaam to neighbouring countries as well as to other major inland cities.<sup>15</sup> The city has attracted many newcomers and this has led to its explosive growth. The resultant high population pressure has accelerated the growth of informal town areas where land use has not been legalised and the increasing demand for infrastructural services has not been sufficiently met. The inadequate provisions of electricity, water supply, waste disposal, transport and telecommunication services are obstacles to the development of business activities. The way in which the city has been laid out does not leave place for informal type businesses in industrial and commercial areas. As a result, these businesses have invaded shop fronts and porches, roadsides, parking lots and so on. In residential areas, roadsides, fences and bus stops are used. Such usage is seldom sanctioned by permission from local authorities.<sup>16</sup>

Only a few markets were officially built, while more than 60 open food markets were built by the small traders themselves. The City recognises them by collecting stand fees, but has not legalised them or guaranteed their existence. The laws governing land ownership in Tanzania are still complex. There is no provision for private

---

<sup>13</sup>It is worth noting that, currently, in Zimbabwe, where the GTZ/ISTARN TAP has enjoyed some success, levels of education are comparatively high. The majority of those who have participated in the ISTARN programme have had O-levels. This is very different from the situation in Tanzania.

<sup>14</sup>The information in this section is taken largely from VETA's *Consolidated Report on Skills Development for the Informal Sector*, June 1999, using 1995 figures from the *Dar es Salaam Informal Sector Survey*, and from Dr Susanna Adam's 1998 study which also drew on this survey.

<sup>15</sup>Anecdotal information is that these linkages are not as well used as they should be because of government inefficiency and public official corruption.

<sup>16</sup>So, for example, one of the interviewers, in this study, noted of a welding business: "They are good in welding but they are doing all of their work under the sun - there is no place to rest." Another said of a car mechanic's premises: "They were really reflecting the informal sector as they had no building to carry on their trade, only a small shade."



ownership, and, in urban areas, leasehold carries with it the demand for development, which is beyond the means of most informal sector operators. The consequence of all this for informal sector enterprise owners is a general sense of insecurity, which is largely warranted.<sup>17</sup>

About 98% of the activities are owned by individual operators, with unregistered co-operatives, partnerships and other types of organisation accounting for only 2%. Women organised activities account for 43% of all informal sector activities in Dar es Salaam, but more than half of these are in the “eating and drinking” category. Our study suggests that there are few informal sector associations. Where enterprise owners/managers belong to associations, these are likely to be political, educational (parent associations), religious or, in some cases, savings clubs.

The 1995 study of the informal sector in Dar es Salaam listed the following main challenges facing the progress of small enterprises:

- ∇ lack of credit;
- ∇ lack of markets;
- ∇ poor infrastructure.

Although a lack of qualified workers was noted, it was at the bottom of the list of problems.

The 1995 survey of the Informal Sector in Dar es Salaam noted a range of informal sector training needs. These were grouped under Agriculture, Manufacturing, Construction, and Transport and Services. Dr Adam’s report also lists a number of existing service providers in the informal sector, including a Folk Development Centre. In other countries, attempts have been made to adapt vocational training centres to provide informal sector training. Experience has shown that this adaptation requires considerable effort on the part of such institutions to change their approach, their curricula and the skills of their teaching staff.

Although the informal sector in Dar es Salaam is growing, indications are that it is growing more slowly than the population in Dar es Salaam. This raises concern about the ambitious hopes of government that the informal sector can “save” the economy of Tanzania. Dr Adam (1998) notes certain changes which would be necessary in order to extend the absorption capacity of the informal sector in Dar es Salaam, and it is useful to list them here as they help to balance the notion that training, in itself, can solve the problems of the informal sector economy:

- ∇ the exposure of enterprise owners to new market niches;
- ∇ the development of public infrastructure;
- ∇ closer linkages between the formal and the informal sectors;
- ∇ greater congruency between government rhetoric with regard to the informal sector, and its development of appropriate policy, legislation, regulations and support systems.

---

<sup>17</sup>Traditional Apprenticeship Practices in Dar es Salaam: A Study (1999) factor e.g. “It seems a sheikh wants to build a residential house here and we will soon have to move.”

We would add here, from our own observation, a need for a general improvement in the economy of Tanzania so that more money is circulating in the economy generally, creating opportunities for informal sector enterprise owners.

This introductory section has attempted to provide a framework for a discussion of the methodology and findings of the study done on the practice of traditional apprenticeship in Dar es Salaam which forms the subject of this report.

## SECTION 2: THE METHODOLOGY USED

### 2.1 TERMINOLOGY USED

The Terms of Reference which shaped this study called for a report on traditional apprenticeship in Dar es Salaam, including recommendations to VETA on possibilities for strengthening or promoting traditional training. The research process was to involve the development of the research method and tools, including a questionnaire, as well as planning and conducting/directing a field survey.<sup>1</sup>

For the purposes of the study, the informal sector was taken to comprise own-account entrepreneurs as well as paid employees, apprentices and family helpers. The size of the informal enterprise was limited to five employees and fewer, with the exception of manufacturing and construction enterprises, where the maximum number was limited to 10 paid employees.

*Traditional apprenticeship* was defined as a situation in which the trainee and/or his/her family and the enterprise owner or manager agreed together that the skills of the business would be passed on to the trainee under certain conditions. The trainee in this situation was referred to as an “apprentice” or “mwanafunzi”.

### 2.2 TRADES SELECTED

Eight trades were selected for surveying (four that were traditionally seen as male dominated, and four that were traditionally seen as female dominated). Information from the 1995 *Dar es Salaam Informal Sector Survey* indicated that there was a total of 345 870 people employed in the sector, of whom 124 873 (36%) were women, and 220 997 (64%) were men. Mjema (1999) notes that urban-based, female teenagers suffer from the highest unemployment levels of any group, and studies generally indicate that women, while well-represented in the informal sector, usually occupy the lowest earning levels and least skilled areas of employment in that sector. It was, therefore, considered important to look at trades which might be attractive to women, and where some degree of skills transfer might raise the capacity of women to improve their position. It is worth noting, however, that in the ISTARN, Zimbabwe TAP, a two-pronged approach has been adopted: on the one hand, skills training is offered in some traditionally women-dominated trades, and, on the other, women have been encouraged to participate in traditionally male-oriented trades. The latter strategy has had some limited success, although ISTARN staff have noted that women in such trades usually need more support than men, particularly in addressing community and family prejudice.

The trades selected were as follows:

√ masonry (including block-making and brick-making)

---

<sup>1</sup>The full Terms of Reference are given as Appendix 1.

- ∇ catering
- ∇ tailoring
- ∇ welding and metal fabrication
- ∇ car mechanics
- ∇ carpentry
- ∇ children's day care
- ∇ hairdressing.

The decision to select only eight trades was made on the basis of the need to have samples large enough to produce meaningful results. Certain categories of informal sector employment were omitted because they did not seem to lend themselves to skills training. So, for example, trade (wholesale and retail) which is the biggest employment category in the informal sector in Dar es Salaam, was omitted.<sup>1</sup>

Catering was selected, because it has the potential for skills transfer, but it is only part of the bigger category of "eating and drinking" which employs more women than any other industry in the informal sector. The category includes *Mama Ntilies* (street side cooked food vendors), but these were not included in the survey as any skills transference involved would be minimal.<sup>2</sup>

Construction is the largest employer of men in the informal sector, after wholesale and retail trade.<sup>3</sup> Tailoring is a trade that employs both men and women, and, falling under the manufacturing of textiles and clothing, employs about 4% of the informal sector workforce.<sup>4</sup> Carpentry falls under "manufacturing of wood and wood products" which employs nine percent of the men in the sector, fewer only than construction, wholesale and retail trade and eating and drinking. Welding and manufacturing fall under "other manufacturing" and was chosen because manufacturing of this kind lends itself particularly well to the traditional apprenticeship practice, as does "repair of motor vehicles and machines" (car mechanics). Hairdressing and children's day care were chosen because of the decision to include traditionally female occupations. They fall under "other services and activities", a relatively small percentage of the total number of those employed, but one in which women predominate.<sup>5</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup>The 1995 *Informal Sector Survey* gave the total number of women employed in this sector as 29 415, and men 94 723, making a total of 124 138, or 36% of the total of 345 870 employed in the informal sector.

<sup>2</sup>The 1995 Survey numbers the women employed in the eating and drinking industry of the informal sector as 67 814, or over 54% of all women employed in the sector.

<sup>3</sup>The Survey numbers the men in this industry as 30 716, or 14% of all the men in the sector.

<sup>4</sup>The Survey gives a total of 13 034 in this trade, with just over 40% being women, and just under 60% being men.

<sup>5</sup>The survey gives a total of 5 320 for the category, of whom 78% are women.

At the end of the interviewing process, the interviewers were asked what other industries or trades they had come across which they thought it might be worthwhile to explore in terms of traditional apprenticeship. For women, they suggested nurseries, florists, decorators (for weddings, parties and functions) and landscape gardening for new buildings. For men, they suggested sign-writing as a possibility.

### 2.3 THE QUESTIONNAIRE

It was decided that only enterprise owners/managers would be interviewed, not apprentices. This was because of the determining significance of the enterprise owner/manager in a traditional apprenticeship system. A questionnaire was designed on the basis of past experience and the specific Dar es Salaam context. It was then translated into KiSwahili.<sup>6</sup> Many problems were experienced in finding appropriate KiSwahili terms for some of the concepts. So, for example, the term “mwanafunzi” is a word for someone who is learning something, but is also the term used for all students - from kindergarten to university. There is no word that is specific for “apprentice”. “Mwanagenzi” used to be the term for the formal apprentice but was avoided because of its connotations with the formal system. In the end, the questionnaire included a description of the concept of “apprentice” in the informal context.

After the questionnaire had been finalised, it was decided to add some trades to the sample (because they were more likely to draw women into the sample), with the result that the questions were not always entirely appropriate to the trades. This was taken into account in the analysis.

### 2.4 THE INTERVIEWERS AND INTERVIEWING PROCESS

Initially six students from the University of Dar es Salaam were employed to conduct the interviews. Five of them were second year students, and one a third year student, four of them in economics, one in education and one in electrical engineering. They have done research before for two other surveys - one on poverty alleviation and the other on elections. They were thoroughly briefed initially, and this briefing included some background to the concept of traditional apprenticeship practice, and an explanation of the purpose of the study. For the first two days they

---

<sup>6</sup>Although the consultants responsible for the study spent some time going through the questionnaire with interviewers to make sure they understood the questions, a basic mistake was made in not getting someone other than the original translator to translate it back into English at the beginning of the process. This was finally done on the sixth day of interviewing. As a result, it was discovered that some of the questions were translated with a slight twist in meaning which gave them some ambiguity, and the answers to those particular questions had to be abandoned for the first 24 questionnaires. The other mistake was in not piloting the questionnaire properly first, but rather using the first few days of interviewing to identify problems and correct them. We were able to do this without rendering the original interviews invalid, but it would have been better to pilot the questionnaire properly first. Both these flaws were a result of a lack of time.

were debriefed twice a day. After that it was decided that they were sufficiently competent and the questionnaire seemed sufficiently correct to move this to once a day, thus lengthening the amount of interview time available to them. The interviews took longer than expected (up to 90 minutes instead of the planned 60 minutes), so, on the sixth day, three new interviewers joined the team. They too were thoroughly briefed. Where interviews were poorly recorded, or where enterprises interviewed did not conform to the agreed criteria, they were rejected, and the interviewer was expected to make up that interview.

Three interviewers worked in each of the areas of Dar es Salaam (Temeke, Kinondoni and Ilala), as a team. Each team was asked to produce 14 acceptable interviews for each of the eight categories, giving a total of 112 interviews from each district and 42 from each category across districts. In the end, the catering sample was slightly smaller than the others (36 instead of 42), because the interviewers were unable to locate more caterers. A total of 330 owners/managers was interviewed. Interviews were conducted seven days a week for 14 days in all. Interviewers were specifically requested to interview enterprise owners or managers.<sup>7</sup> They were also warned not to look specifically for enterprise owners who had trainees in preference to those who did not. Each team bused to the area where it was working daily, and they were instructed to do interviews at varying distances from the bus stop, to prevent any bias towards only those businesses close to the bus stops.

For further studies of this sort, it is worth noting some of the problems with the process identified by the interviewers:

- ∇ They struggled to find sufficient masons, caterers and child care businesses, all trades or industries that do not have “displays”. Masons (bricklayers and concrete slab throwers) could only be found on building sites and were not willing to stop their work for an hour to be interviewed. Because of this, brick and block makers were also included after the initial few days.
- ∇ Business owners/managers were suspicious and thought that the interviewers were from the Revenue Authority. Although interviewers were given letters from VETA to confirm their *bona fides*, they thought it would have been better to have letters specific to the different trades (e.g. a letter from the Department of Welfare for the child care businesses).
- ∇ People wanted money for the interview and asked the interviewers to organise loans for them. They needed to be persuaded to be interviewed. Some complained that they had been “interviewed many times and never see the results”. The interviewers felt that it was important that the respondents get some feedback on the results of the survey.
- ∇ The questionnaires were too long and some of the questions were too complex.
- ∇ Businesses were far apart and “in market places, residential areas, under big trees, near main roads and in feeder roads”.

---

**Traditional Apprenticeship Practices in Dar es Salaam: A Study (1999)** was employed in government service or elsewhere and had a business as a side line.

Each of the interviewers was also asked to make some personal observations about the businesses visited which, where relevant, were analysed. Each team was asked to write a summary report on the process.

Once a questionnaire had been accepted, it was entered into Lotus 123 and checked. It was then imported into Statistix 4.1 for analysis.

This process enabled the researchers to:

- ∇ Develop a profile of the survey sample and their businesses;
- ∇ Develop an education and training profile of the sample;
- ∇ Assess traditional apprenticeship practices in the sample;
- ∇ Use cross referencing to try and establish links and causes and effects.

These are reflected in Sections 3, 4 and 5 of the report, which give details of the findings of the survey.

## SECTION 3: PROFILE OF THE SAMPLE SURVEYED

### 3.1 WHO ARE THE OWNERS AND MANAGERS?

The interviewers were instructed to interview only enterprise owners or managers. In the final analysis, the division was:

50.6% Owner  
49.4% Manager

It is interesting that almost half of those “in charge” were, in fact, not owners. One possible interpretation of this is that the owners are, themselves, employed elsewhere, and the business is used to supplement a salary. Another is that, rather than “grow” a successful business so that it is big enough to attract the attention of the authorities, successful enterprise owners start other small businesses and employ others to run some of them. This invites further investigation. There is evidence (see later) that existing businesses have grown to some degree over the past two years.

The enterprises most likely to be run by an owner<sup>1</sup> were those in carpentry and construction, followed quite closely by tailoring. Those least likely to be run by owners were the child care enterprises, but more than half the hairdressing and catering enterprises were also run by managers.

**Table 3.1: Status of Respondent by Trade**

	<b>Number interviewed</b>	<b>Owner</b>	<b>Manager</b>
Masons	42	61.9%	38.1%
Caterers <sup>2</sup>	36	47.2%	52.8%
Tailors	42	59.5%	40.5
Welders	42	52.4%	47.6%
Car mechanics	42	52.4%	47.6%
Carpenters	42	64.3%	35.7%
Child carers	42	23.8%	76.2%
Hairdressers	42	42.9%	57.1%

---

<sup>1</sup>This was determined by the status of the respondents in the businesses.

<sup>2</sup>The number of caterers interviewed was lower than that of any other trade as the interviewers had difficulty finding them.



The great majority of the businesses were owned by one person (64.4%), with 21.3% being owned by a group of people, 10.3% by a family, and 3.9% falling into the “other” category, which included religious organisations, savings clubs or businesses, non-governmental organisations, parents’ associations, political parties and groupings of retrenchees.

Of the owners interviewed, 63.3% were men and 23.0% were women. If the sample is a true reflection of the sector, then it indicates that a higher proportion of women than men in the sector are employees. This is in contradiction to the findings of the 1995 Survey which may be because enterprises such as the *Mama Ntilies* were specifically excluded from this sample. Managers were also predominantly male (60.4% to 39.6% female). This was despite the effort to ensure that half the sample came from traditionally female trades, and confirms the general perception that women are concentrated at the lower end of the income earning jobs in the informal sector. When the total sample of owners<sup>3</sup> was taken, by trade, the gender distribution was as follows:

**Table 3.2: Owners by Trade and Gender**

TRADE	MALE %	FEMALE %	BOTH %	NOT APPLICABLE %
Masons	88.1	4.8	4.8	2.4
Caterers	50.0	30.6	16.7	2.8
Tailors	69.0	19.0	11.9	0.0
Welders	92.9	0.0	7.1	0.0
Car mechanics	92.9	7.1	0.0	0.0
Carpenters	92.9	0.0	4.8	2.4
Child carers	16.7	33.3	31.0	19.0
Hairdressers	2.4	90.5	7.1	0.0

Of the traditionally female occupations, ownership of only hairdressing (which excluded barbers) was dominated by women. The assumption had been made that catering would be a female-dominated trade, but the findings show that 50% of the catering businesses were solely owned by men, with a further 16.7% owned by men and women, and only 30.6% by women alone. The interviewers observed that it was not just a case of men managing such businesses: “They are even doing the cooking”. Tailoring was also male-dominated, with only 19.0% owned by women on their own, and a further 11.9% by men and women. In childcare, while women formed the biggest group of owners (33.3%), 16.7% of the businesses were owned by men alone, and a further 31.0% by men and women together.

<sup>3</sup>All the enterprises in the survey.

**Table 3.3: Age of Respondents**

Ages	Percentage
18-24 years	14.8%
25-29 years	22.4%
30-39 years	41.5%
40-49 years	18.2%
Over 50 years	3.0%

Broken into trades, the figures were as follows:

**Table 3.4: Age of Respondents by Trade**

	Under 18 years %	18 - 24 years %	25 - 29 years %	30 - 39 years %	40 - 49 years %	50 years and over %
Masons	0.0	16.7	21.4	38.1	19.0	4.8
Caterers	0.0	13.9	11.1	36.1	36.1	2.8
Tailors	0.0	11.9	23.8	45.2	14.3	4.8
Welders	0.0	16.7	21.4	38.1	16.7	7.1
Car mechanics	0.0	4.8	21.4	52.4	21.4	0.0
Carpenters	0.0	19.0	26.2	35.7	14.3	4.8
Child carers	0.0	7.1	21.4	47.6	23.8	0.0
Hairdressers	0.0	28.6	31.0	38.1	2.4	0.0

In general, the youngest grouping of entrepreneurs were the hairdressers. One of the reasons for this, probably, is that the barriers to entry in this trade, in particular the cost of equipment, are very low.<sup>4</sup> Probably for the same reason, the age level for carpentry is also relatively low (45.2% below 30). Conversely, catering (75% over 30), car mechanics (73.8% over 30) and child caring (71.4% over 30) seem to be more difficult trades to enter and owners/managers are older.

The educational levels of those interviewed were as follows:

---

<sup>4</sup>In fact, some of the ISTARN studies have shown that hairdressers are quite reluctant to take on apprentices "because as soon as they have a few skills they set up in business on their own". In this study in Dar es Salaam, hairdressers had proportionately fewer apprentices than all the trades except child carers and caterers.

**Table 3.5: Educational Levels of Respondents**

Level of Education	Percentage
None	0.3%
Incomplete primary	4.0%
Complete primary	51.4%
Incomplete O Level	6.4%
Complete O Level	25.8%
Incomplete A Level	1.2%
Complete A Level	2.4%
Incomplete higher institutions of learning	0.6%
Complete higher institutions of learning	3.3%
Additional formal and non-formal vocational training	15.8%

This table indicates that over a quarter of the respondents had O Levels. This is a higher proportion than other studies have found. However, this may be because child carers have not usually been included as informal sector workers and their relatively high levels of formal education might have distorted the overall picture.

**Table 3.6: Educational Level by Trade**

	O Level or more	Additional formal or non-formal vocational training
Masons	11.9%	16.7%
Caterers	52.8%	19.4%
Tailors	19.0%	4.8%
Welders	31.0%	16.7%
Mechanics	31.0%	16.7%
Carpenters	14.3%	23.8%
Child carers	73.8%	33.3%
Hairdressers	33.3%	11.9%

As can be seen in Table 3.6, the aggregated percentages, broken down by trade, yield some interesting data. Child carers had the highest levels of education, followed by caterers. For all the other trades, fewer than half the sample had O

Levels. The most common educational level was completed primary school, for every trade, except child carers, where it was completed O Levels. In general, education levels across all the trades, except child caring, were low. A number of the child care enterprise owners/managers appear, in fact, to be qualified primary school teachers,

In fact, levels of formal education seem to be increasing despite the problems with Tanzanian education and the managers and owners of the new businesses seem to be more likely to have O Levels than the managers and owners of the older businesses.

**Table 3.7: Educational Level by Length of Time the Business has been in Existence**

	<b>O Level or more</b>	<b>Additional formal or non-formal vocational training</b>
Under 1 year	42.6%	16.2%
1 - 3 years	44.9%	19.4%
4 - 5 years	34.1%	25.0%
Over 5 years	21.2%	10.6%

It may also be that, because it is getting harder to find jobs in the formal sector, more people with higher levels of education are setting up or running businesses in the informal sector.

In addition to schooling, 41 of the respondents (12.4%) also noted that they had had vocational training, whether formal or nonformal. This included training at vocational training centres, teaching certificates, informal seminars, courses offered by commercial companies (e.g. sewing skills from Singer), and trade testing. The group most likely to have had some form of vocational training (33.3%) were those running child care businesses (see the explanation about primary school teachers above), followed by caterers (19.4%). Thus the two groups with the highest levels of formal education were also the most likely to have been able to access training for additional qualifications. Roughly the same proportion of masons, mechanics, welders and carpenters (16.7%) had had access to some form of additional qualification. The percentage for tailors, at 4.8%, was the lowest, and 11.9% of hairdressers had some form of additional vocational training..

### 3.2 PROFILE OF THE BUSINESSES IN THE SURVEY

We looked first at how long enterprises had been operating.

**Table 3.8: Length of Time Businesses Operating**

Length of time business in existence	Percentage
Under 1 year	21.5%
1-3 years	30.9%
4-5 years	14.5%
Over 5 years	33.0%

When this was analysed by trade, the breakdown was as follows:

**Table 3.9: Length of Time in Business by Trade**

	Under 1 year	1 - 3 years	4 - 5 years	Over 5 years
Masons	9.5%	26.2%	16.7%	47.6%
Caterers	22.2%	25.0%	13.9%	38.9%
Tailors	19.0%	28.6%	16.7%	35.7%
Welders	14.3%	31.0%	21.4%	33.3%
Mechanics	11.9%	40.5%	14.3%	33.3%
Carpenters	26.2%	26.2%	14.3%	33.3%
Children's day carers	28.6%	26.2%	16.7%	28.6%
Hairdressers	40.5%	42.9%	2.4%	14.3%

From this it appears that hairdressing businesses are either a new development, or that they do not last long. The very great majority had only existed for 3 years, and a substantial number for under one year. The most well-established businesses were in construction, but there were relatively few new businesses in this area. There were also few new car mechanic businesses.

Businesses from the different trades were fairly evenly spread across types of location, so that, for example, one was as likely to find a mason or a caterer or a tailor or a car mechanic or a carpenter or a hairdresser on the sidewalk or in a market area or a residential backyard. The only exception to this was, not

**Traditional Apprenticeship Practice in Dar Es Salaam: A Study (1999)**

surprisingly, child care, where the vast majority of businesses were most likely to be found in a residential backyard.<sup>5</sup>

Employment at these businesses has grown over the past two years, with businesses employing an average of 1.8 permanent employees per business now, as against only 1.1 per business two years ago.

**Table 3.10: Comparison of Number of Employees over Two Year Period**

	Now	Two years ago
Permanent workers	587	373
Casual labourers	177	104
Family helpers	41	11
Others	15	3
TOTAL	820	491

Disaggregated by trade, the analysis of permanent employees, looks like this:

**Table 3.11: Comparison of Number of Permanent Employees over Two Year Period by Trade**

	Now		Two years ago	
	No	%	No	%
Masons	80	13.6%	45	12.1%
Caterers	104	17.7%	92	24.7%
Tailors	61	10.4%	46	12.3%
Welders	69	11.8%	22	5.9%
Mechanics	60	10.2%	42	11.3%
Carpenters	83	14.1%	44	11.8%
Child carers	72	12.3%	51	13.7%
Hairdressers	58	9.9%	31	8.3%
TOTAL	587	100.0%	373	100.0%

---

<sup>5</sup>The questionnaire did not explore environmental or safety conditions specifically, but the interviewers mentioned, on several occasions, that "the working environment was not good for the health", citing the lack of protective equipment/clothing, the use of charcoal, and the lack of cleanliness.

The increase in permanent staff, thus, cut across all trades although, in some trades, the increase was smaller than in others. So, for example, although there was a slight increase in numbers for caterers, their percentage of permanent employees overall fell. They remain, however, the biggest employers out of the eight trades, with hairdressers the smallest.

The growth in permanent employees was in line with the fact that most respondents believed that their businesses had expanded over the past two years:

**Table 3.12: Business Expansion**

Business expanded over past two years	Percentage
Yes	58.0%
No	36.2%
Don't know	1.8%
New business	4.0%

When looked at in terms of trade, business expansion shows the following:

**Table 3.13: Business Expansion by Trade**

	Yes	No	Don't know	New business
Masons	61.9%	38.1%	0.0%	0.0%
Caterers	58.3%	36.1%	2.8%	2.8%
Tailors	69.0%	23.8%	0.0%	7.1%
Welders	61.0%	36.6%	0.0%	2.4%
Car mechanics	39.0%	58.5%	0.0%	2.4%
Carpenters	54.8%	42.9%	2.4%	0.0%
Child carers	65.9%	19.5%	7.3%	7.3%
Hairdressers	53.7%	34.1%	2.4%	9.8%

Only car mechanics had more businesses that had not expanded than had expanded.

It is useful to look at this table in conjunction with the tables on demand for products. Despite the optimistic view of business growth, more than half the respondents did not believe that there was sufficient demand for their products or services, and this does not bode well for the future. However, 65.4% of those whose businesses had expanded over the past two years said that there was a demand for their products or

services. This indicates that the perception of demand may be related, to some degree, to how good you are at running a business. Nor did the perception of demand seem to be significantly affected by whether the respondent was a manager or an owner, with slightly more managers than owners having a positive perception of demand.

**Table 3.14: Demand for Products and Services**

Sufficient demand	Percentage
Yes	44.8%
No	51.2%
Fluctuates/seasonal	4.0%

**Table 3.15: Demand for Products and Services by Trade**

	Yes %	No %	Fluctuates/seasonal/sometimes %
Masons	47.6	52.4	0.0
Caterers	50.0	38.9	11.1
Tailors	50.0	47.6	2.4
Welders	23.8	66.7	9.5
Mechanics	38.1	57.1	4.8
Carpenters	40.5	59.5	0.0
Child carers	68.3	29.3	2.4
Hairdressers	41.5	56.1	2.4

Only in tailoring, catering and child care were there at least as many respondents who believed that there was sufficient demand for their goods or services as there were who did not.

This may indicate that the saturation point has been reached in trades such as welding, carpentry<sup>6</sup>, hairdressing and motor mechanics. The reasons given for the lack of demand by respondents from these trades confirm that this is also their perception:

*There are many places doing the same business.*

---

<sup>6</sup>Despite this, it was interesting to note that several of the carpenters interviewed mentioned that they shared tools with other carpenters.



*Services like this are too many in the area.*

*There are many competitors.*

Some also referred to the state of the economy (*"People do not have money"*), and even to their own competence (*"I am not competent enough compared to my neighbours"*).

We also looked at demand in relation to location of business (market area or business centre/residential property/sidewalk of a main street/other) but this variable did not seem to make much difference, with demand appearing, if anything, to be slightly less in a market area or business centre than in other locations.

There was no relationship between employing apprentices and a perception that there is or is not a demand for goods and services. Respondents who believed there was insufficient demand were as likely to have apprentices as those who did not. This lends some credence to the claim by the great majority of respondents that they take on apprentices out of altruism rather than the need for cheap labour.

When asked about problems that had faced them, or still did, the respondents' responses suggested that starting out was difficult, and that, while the situation did improve over time to some degree, there were certain significant areas that remained problematic. Nevertheless, while five out of the eight specified problems areas were experienced by over 50% of the respondents initially as difficult or very difficult, only three out of eight were still experienced as difficult or very difficult currently.

**Table 3.16: Problems Experienced Initially in Setting up Business**

	<b>Very Difficult</b>	<b>Difficult</b>	<b>Not Difficult</b>
Finding a plot	60.8%	18.6%	20.6%
Infrastructure	14.7%	33.7%	51.7%
Financing	58.7%	34.6%	6.7%
Tools, machines	35.2%	45.2%	19.7%
Raw material	11.5%	38.3%	50.2%
Marketing	51.3%	38.4%	10.3%
Advice	4.0%	34.2%	61.7%
Skills/know-how	7.2%	28.5%	64.3%
License/registration	34.1%	25.3%	40.6%
Informal relations	12.6%	33.8%	53.6%
Other	37.5%	50.0%	12.5%

**Table 3.17: Problems Experienced by Businesses Currently**

	<b>Very Difficult</b>	<b>Difficult</b>	<b>Not Difficult</b>
Finding a plot	27.0%	14.4%	58.6%
Infrastructure	4.8%	19.2%	76.0%
Financing	18.7%	44.9%	36.4%
Tools, machines	18.9%	42.7%	38.4%
Raw material	7.4%	27.9%	64.7%
Marketing	29.6%	47.8%	22.5%
Advice	3.5%	21.1%	75.4%
Skills/know-how	1.6%	21.8%	76.6%
License/registration	23.6%	18.3%	58.1%
Informal relations	4.7%	34.8%	60.4%
Other	55.6%	22.2%	22.2%

Not surprisingly, finding a plot is far more of a problem initially than later. This also relates to the lack of land demarcated for, or even available for, informal sector business activity (mentioned in Section 1). Financing appears to get easier, for some, but it remains a problem for 63.6%. This finding confirms that access to finance is a critical area for the informal sector. The tables also show that marketing remains the single most problematic issue for these enterprise owners, with only 22.5% not finding it a problem. Interestingly, skills/know-how is not seen as a problematic area by that many enterprise owners/managers, either initially or later. A total of 64.3% found it an unproblematic area initially, and 76.6% find it unproblematic now. It ranks at the bottom of the priority list of difficulties, both initially and currently. While this may show that enterprise owners/managers are simply not aware of their lack of skill, it does raise the issue of how one convinces them that they need to prioritise training! It is also in line with a 1996 finding<sup>7</sup> that only 20% of informal sector enterprise owners saw their own low level of skill as a stumbling block to success.

Marketing remains a huge problem. In order for this problem to be addressed, there has to be a potential market and linkages to the formal sector. At the moment,<sup>8</sup> the main customers for the informal sector are private individuals or households (93%), some small-scale businesses and only a few larger shops. The majority of activities seem to circulate within their own sectoral boundaries. About 56% of the operators in the 1995 survey of the informal sector secured their raw materials and supplies

---

<sup>7</sup>Mwinuka (1996).

<sup>8</sup>Adam (1998).

from within their district of residence, 16% from other districts in Dar es Salaam, 19% from other regions in Tanzania and 4.5% imported from other countries. The bulk of outputs was produced for local (district) markets (86%), and not even for other districts in Dar es Salaam. The 1995 survey also found that a lack of customers and orders (demand) was the problem cited second most often by informal sector businesses as a whole (after lack of capital), and that it was cited most often in the construction industry and the service industry.

By trade, respondents ranked their “very difficult” problems, from most difficult to least difficult, as follows:

**Table 3.18: Problems By Trade**

**a Masons**

<b>Problem in rank order from most difficult to least difficult</b>	<b>Initially</b>	<b>Currently</b>
Finding a plot	3	1
Infrastructure	7	10
Financing	1	4
Tools, machines	5	3
Raw material	9	5
Marketing	2	7
Advice	10	9
Skills/know-how	8	8
License/registration, etc	4	2
Informal relations	6	6
Other	11	11

**b Caterers**

<b>Problem in rank order from most difficult to least difficult</b>	<b>Initially</b>	<b>Currently</b>
Finding a plot	1	1
Infrastructure	6	7
Financing	2	4
Tools, machines	4	5
Raw material	7	8
Marketing	3	3
Advice	10	10
Skills/know-how	9	9
License/registration	5	2
Informal relations	8	6
Other	11	11

**c Tailors**

<b>Problem in rank order from most difficult to least difficult</b>	<b>Initially</b>	<b>Currently</b>
Finding a plot	2	2
Infrastructure	8	10
Financing	1	4
Tools, machines	4	3
Raw materials	6	7
Marketing	3	1
Advice	10	6
Skills/know-how	7	11
License/registration, etc	5	5
Informal relations	9	9
Other	11	11

**d Welders**

<b>Problem in rank order from most difficult to least difficult</b>	<b>Initially</b>	<b>Currently</b>
Finding a plot	1	4
Infrastructure	8	8
Financing	2	2
Tools, machines	5	5
Raw material	6	6
Marketing	3	1
Advice	9	9
Skills/know-how	10	10
License/registration etc	4	3
Informal relations	7	7
Other	11	11

**e Mechanics**

<b>Problem in rank order from most difficult to least difficult</b>	<b>Initially</b>	<b>Currently</b>
Finding a plot	1	5
Infrastructure	6	8
Financing	2	6
Tools, machines	4	2
Raw material	8	7
Marketing	3	3
Advice	10	9
Skills/know-how	9	10
License/registration etc	5	4
Informal relations	7	1
Other	11	11

**f Carpenters**

<b>Problem in rank order from most difficult to least difficult</b>	<b>Initially</b>	<b>Currently</b>
Finding a plot	3	4
Infrastructure	6	6
Financing	1	5
Tools, machines	4	3
Raw material	7	7
Marketing	2	1
Advice	8	9
Skill/know-how	10	10
License/registration, etc	5	2
Informal relations	9	8
Other	11	11

**g Child carers**

<b>Problem in rank order from most difficult to least difficult</b>	<b>Initially</b>	<b>Currently</b>
Finding a plot	1	2
Infrastructure	5	9
Financing	2	5
Tools, machines	3	1
Raw material	8	8
Marketing	4	4
Advice	10	10
Skills/know-how	7	6
License/registration, etc	6	3
Informal relations	9	7
Other	11	11

## h Hairdressers

<b>Problem in rank order from most difficult to least difficult</b>	<b>Initially</b>	<b>Currently</b>
Finding a plot	2	3
Infrastructure	10	8
Financing	3	4
Tools, machines	7	9
Raw material	9	6
Marketing	1	2
Advice	8	10
Skills/know-how	6	7
License/registration, etc	4	1
Informal relations	3	5
Other	11	11

The only two problem areas which were never prioritised in the top five are “Advice” and “Skills/know-how”.

A surprisingly large number of enterprises used electrical machines in their businesses (52.0%), and a high percentage (73.9%) had electricity available, but only 62.5% had readily accessible water. The fact, however, that both these services were quite widely available may be one of the reasons why infrastructure was not seen as a major problem by a high proportion of the respondents.

**Table 3.19: Access to Infrastructure by Trade**

	<b>Use of electric machines</b>	<b>Access to water</b>	<b>Access to electricity</b>
Masons	7.1%	54.8%	21.4%
Caterers	63.9%	91.7%	91.7%
Tailors	69.0%	54.8%	92.9%
Welders	95.2%	66.7%	95.2%
Mechanics	61.9%	59.5%	73.8%
Carpenters	16.7%	38.1%	33.3%
Child carers	7.1%	66.7%	78.6%
Hairdressers	95.2%	69.0%	100.0%

Carpentry, child care and masonry clearly used very low levels of technology. Welding and hairdressing used high levels. Hairdressers were more reliant on electricity than they were on water, and masons seemed to get by with relatively little of either.

The interviewers were asked to give their perceptions of each of the enterprises visited. These were obviously subjective, but are worth noting here.

The interviewers' assessment was that 20.4% of the businesses they visited were not profitable, that 73.8% were profitable, and that 5.8% were very profitable. Their impression was that 63.9% of the businesses were busy, 34.9% were not and, in the case of 1.2%, they were unable to make an assessment. On a scale of 1 to 5, where 1 indicates "I would be very willing to purchase goods and services from the enterprise" and 5 "very unwilling", the interviewers rated the businesses they visited as follows:

**Table 3.20: Interviewer Confidence Ratings**

Rating	Percentage
1	28.4%
2	34.1%
3	21.6%
4	11.9%
5	4.0%

In other words, from the viewpoint of the interviewers, by far the greater number of enterprises they visited were offering services and products they would have been happy to purchase. Nevertheless, the observation of the researcher was that quality was often poor. In recording their general impressions, the interviewers noted generally low levels of productivity for a range of reasons, including a lack of skills, lack of equipment, lack of space and lack of work. The comment: "*At that time I found them doing nothing*" was made repeatedly.<sup>1</sup>

### 3.3 SUMMARY

In summary, the profile that emerges from the sample of enterprise owners/managers, is of a sector that has expanded over the past two years, but where, in some trades, growth may be slowing down; a sector where women are under-represented at the owner/manager level; and a sector which perceives

---

<sup>1</sup>Nevertheless, there were a number of businesses that were described in glowing terms as being pleasant and busy and producing good quality goods or services.



problems related to space, financing, marketing, tools and the regulatory framework as far more serious than those related to advice and skills/know-how.

## SECTION 4: TRADITIONAL APPRENTICESHIP PRACTICE

### 4.1 PREVALENCE OF THE PRACTICE

Of the enterprises visited, 52.1% had apprentices. This represented a total of 172 businesses. The total number of apprentices currently in training was 556. But 58.8% (194) of the businesses had had apprentices in the past five years. The total number of apprentices employed by the sample over the past five years was 1 350. This worked out at an average of 4.1 apprentices per business. This is considerably higher than, for example, the proportion of apprentices (two per enterprise) to businesses found in a baseline study done by ISTARN, Zimbabwe, in the district of Masvingo, Zimbabwe, before it piloted its TAP.<sup>2</sup> However, Dr Susanna Adam, a GTZ/VETA consultant who has worked in the informal sector in Tanzania believes that apprenticeship is viewed somewhat differently in Tanzania from the way it is in other parts of Africa, partly because the industrial base is so small. Her impression is that any concept of apprenticeship is very rudimentary, and may well include people working in the business who are not really there on the basis of even a verbal agreement that a training process will take place. The principle that the number of apprentices in a business will be determined by demand and workload, noted by Mavunduse (1995) in his Zimbabwean study, does not seem to apply in Tanzania. This strengthens our perception that the traditional practice is more developed and market-oriented in Zimbabwe than it is in Tanzania.

**Table 4.1: Number of Businesses Currently with Apprentices by Trade**

	Number	Percentage of businesses in the trade	Percentage of total that have apprentices <sup>3</sup>
Masons	26	61.9%	13.4%
Caterers	13	36.1%	6.7%
Tailors	27	64.3%	13.9%
Welders	35	83.3%	18.0%
Mechanics	37	88.1%	19.1%
Carpenters	33	78.6%	17.0%
Child carers	6	14.3%	3.1%
Hairdressers	17	40.5%	8.8%
TOTAL	194		100.0%

---

<sup>2</sup>Mavunduse (1995).

<sup>3</sup>There were fewer caterers (36) than any of the other trades (42)

The practice is clearly not common in child care businesses, and it is relatively uncommon in hairdressing and catering. Welders, mechanics and carpenters, all traditionally male occupations, appear to make extensive use of apprentices, as do tailors. Fewer than half the hairdressers had had apprentices in the past five years.<sup>4</sup> On these findings, it seems likely that men would have an easier time finding an apprenticeship place than would women, within the constraints of traditionally male and female occupations. This is born out by an analysis of the number of apprentices currently by trade:

**Table 4.2: Number of Apprentices Currently by Trade**

	<b>Number</b>	<b>Percentage</b>
Masons	75	13.5%
Caterers	38	6.8%
Tailors	57	10.3%
Welders	95	17.1%
Car mechanics	165	29.7%
Carpenters	95	17.1%
Child carers	8	1.4%
Hairdressers	23	4.1%
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>556</b>	<b>100.0%</b>

The car mechanics enterprises employ by far the most apprentices, while the traditionally female occupations employ far less than the traditionally male occupations. This predominance of apprentices in the traditionally male occupations was confirmed by an analysis of the number of apprentices by trade over the past five years:

<sup>4</sup>In an earlier footnote we referred to the finding in Zimbabwe that hairdressers were generally reluctant to take on apprentices because it is so easy for them to set up in competition once they have a few skills. Although hairdressing enterprises in Dar es Salaam do run the gamut from one person enterprises on the side of the road, to full-blown salons, ease of entry at the bottom end is marked.

**Table 4.3: Number of Apprentices over 5 Years by Trade**

	<b>Number</b>	<b>Percentage</b>
Masons	208	15.4%
Caterers	80	5.9%
Tailors	281	20.8%
Welders	208	15.4%
Mechanics	308	22.8%
Carpenters	207	15.3%
Child carers	16	1.2%
Hairdressers	42	3.2%
TOTAL	1350	100.0%

The only major difference, as compared to the current situation, is that of tailors. It appears that the apprenticeship practice is shrinking in the tailoring business. This does not appear to be because of demand (there were at least as many tailors in the sample of respondents who believed that the demand for business was growing as there were those who did not). It may be because tailors are increasingly seeing themselves as running “courses” rather than an apprenticeship process. (See other data later in the report.)

We analysed the apprenticeship practice by district of Dar es Salaam and found that this was not a significant variable. The practice is as prevalent in each of the three districts, Temeke, Ilala and Kinondoni, as in any other.

#### **4.2 PROFILE OF THE APPRENTICES**

Of the apprentices who had been in the businesses over the past five years, 79.3% had been men and only 20.7% had been women. Again, this was despite the effort in the survey to balance traditional male occupations and female occupations. However, despite the fact that ownership of enterprises in trades such as tailoring, catering and child care was as likely or more likely to be male, apprentices in these businesses were more likely to be female.

**Table 4.4: Number of Apprentices over 5 Years by Trade and Gender**

	Male			Female		
	No	% of total males	% of trade	No	% of total females	% of trade
Masons	207	19.3%	99.5%	1	0.4%	0.5%
Caterers	31	2.9%	38.8%	49	17.5%	61.2%
Tailors	117	10.9%	41.6%	164	58.6%	58.4%
Welders	202	18.9%	97.1%	6	2.1%	2.9%
Mechanics	301	28.1%	97.7%	7	2.5%	2.3%
Carpenters	205	19.2%	99.0%	2	0.7%	1.0%
Child carers	3	0.3%	18.8%	13	4.6%	81.3%
Hairdressers	4	0.4%	9.5%	38	13.6%	90.5%
TOTAL	1070	100.0%		280	100.0%	

The picture that emerges is of male ownership or management, and female workers at the bottom end of employment in the trade. In a service trade such as child care, where the number of male owners, and of ownerships that are jointly male and female, is growing, the vast majority of the apprentices remain female.

Historically in Africa, there was tendency for enterprise owners to favour family members in entering into apprenticeship agreements, but the introduction of more modern trades has had the effect of lessening this bias. This was born out by the study, where only 17.1% of the current apprentices were found to be related to enterprise owners or managers.

Initially, the researchers did not include a question about the age of the apprentices. The assumption was made that they would mainly be young - children who left school after seven years, and whose parents approached an enterprise owner to train them. However, after the sixth day, a question on age was included, and produced some surprising results. Of those apprentices whose age was asked (384 or 69.1%), the age distribution was:

**Table 4.5: Age of Apprentices**

Age	Percentage
14 -16 years	5.2 %
17 -18 years	34.1%
Over 19 years	60.7%

GTZ/VETA staff were surprised by the small number of 14 - 16 year olds in apprenticeship. An explanation for this might be that school leavers are expected to take on family duties such as care of younger siblings. Another might be that school leavers spend time looking for formal sector employment initially and only accept the informal sector as an option when they have exhausted all other possibilities. VETA staff also suggested that respondents may have lied about age because the child labour laws prohibit anyone under 18 from being employed (as opposed to being trained).

The breakdown of the current apprentices by trade and age is as follows:

**Table 4.6: Age of Current Apprentices by Trade and Age**

	14 - 16 years		17 - 18 years		Over 19 years	
	No	%	No	%	No	%
Masons	1	1.9%	10	18.5%	43	79.6%
Caterers	0	0.0%	5	50.0%	5	50.0%
Tailors	9	30.0%	11	36.7%	10	33.3%
Welders	3	5.2%	31	53.4%	24	41.4%
Mechanics	2	2.0%	51	50.5%	48	47.5%
Carpenters	2	4.8%	14	33.3%	26	61.9%
Child carers	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	8	100.0%
Hairdressers	3	17.6%	9	52.9%	5	29.4%

Clearly, the tailoring apprentices tend to be younger, and the catering and childcare apprentices older. Hairdressing apprentices are also generally younger.

### 4.3 THE APPRENTICESHIP RELATIONSHIP

Why do businesses take on apprentices? Reasons given are as follows:

**Table 4.7: Reasons for Taking Apprentices**

Reason given	Percentage <sup>5</sup>
To get extra help	27.3%
To help young people get a start in life	89.7%
To expand the business	10.3%
To get training fees	2.6%
Kinship	3.1%
Other reasons	2.6%

While altruism emerges in this table as the main reason for businesses taking on apprentices (as it did in various of the ISTARN, Zimbabwe, studies), it may be that the other reasons, in fact, count for more, and that the 27.3% for “to get extra help”, in fact, represents an honest response. Some GTZ/VETA staff contest this, saying that the culture developed in Tanzania during the African socialism years encourages people to help one another, and that this accounts for the high percentage who say that they take on apprentices for altruistic reasons. The finding that the perception that there is or is not a demand for an enterprise's goods or services, does not influence the number of apprentices in a business, tends to endorse this view.

The reasons why owners take on apprentices, by trade, were as follows:

**Table 4.8: Reasons for Taking Apprentices by Trade**

	Masons	Caterers	Tailors	Welders	Mechanics	Carpenters	Child carers	Hair-dressers
To get extra help	38.5%	61.5%	11.1%	17.1%	18.9%	21.2%	83.3%	23.5%
To help young people get a start in life	96.2%	76.9%	81.5%	97.1%	94.6%	93.9%	83.3%	70.6%
To expand the business	11.5%	30.8%	11.1%	11.4%	2.7%	9.1%	0.0%	23.5%
To get training fees	3.8%	0.0%	7.4%	0.0%	2.7%	9.1%	0.0%	0.0%
Kinship	0.0%	7.7%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	9.1%	0.0%	11.8%
Other	0.0%	7.7%	7.4%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	11.8%

<sup>5</sup>Some respondents chose more than one answer.

Assuming that all owners/managers are as altruistic as they claim to be, then the desire to help young people get a start in life cuts across the trades, with hairdressers being the least altruistic grouping. A high percentage of caterers and child carers are simply looking for additional help. Caterers and hairdressers also need more people to help them expand their businesses. A surprisingly small number of tailors said that they chose to have apprentices because of the training fee. At 7.4%, tailors do, however, rate this reason more highly than anyone else. Figures elsewhere in the report suggest that, in fact, tailors are offering a training-for-fees service. Kinship is not a factor at all in most of the trades.<sup>6</sup>

When asked what factors were most important to a business in selecting an apprentice, the respondents gave the following answers:

**Table 4.9: Important Factors in Apprentice Selection**

Important factors	Percentage
Money offered by apprentice	5.7%
Kinship and family ties	5.7%
Level of education of candidate	45.9%
Previous work experience	3.1%
Trustworthiness of candidate	71.6%
Aptitude for the work	26.8%
Age	49.0%
Other (including mainly the need for an adult/guardian reference person, good health, sanity and interest in the work)	21.6%

Asked what they meant by “age”, respondents said that they preferred apprentices to be between 16 and 18 years of age. Presumably this is young enough not to expect much by way of payment, and old enough to be taken as an apprentice legally and to be useful. One member of the GTZ/VETA staff told the researchers that, if someone had not sorted himself/herself out by the age of 19, there wasn’t much hope for him/her!

The concern about trustworthiness was also expressed by enterprise owners in the ISTARN, Zimbabwe, TAP. “Masters” expect apprentices to be able to take charge of the workshop in time and, thus, have to be able to trust them. It would be interesting to know how “aptitude for the work” is tested in the traditional practice. For intervention programmes that attempt to add value to the traditional practice, selection of appropriate candidates for the programme remains a problem. Level of

---

<sup>6</sup>There was one instance among the sample where an apprentice was quoted as having “bought” into the business by providing tools, and was seen as a joint owner.



education was seen as important which is probably natural in a situation where standards of education are falling.

Factors influencing selection of apprentices were broken down by trade and yielded the following analysis:

**Table 4.10: Important Factors in Apprentice Selection by Trade**

	Masons	Caterers	Tailors	Welders	Mechanics	Carpenters	Child carers	Hair-dressers
Money	1 3.8%	0 0.0%	4 14.8%	2 5.7%	0 0.0%	4 12.1%	0 0.0%	0 0.0%
Kinship	2 7.7%	0 0.0%	2 7.4%	3 8.6%	0 0.0%	3 9.1%	0 0.0%	1 5.9%
Educational level	7 26.9%	10 76.9%	14 51.9%	21 60.0%	12 32.4%	15 45.5%	2 33.3%	8 47.1%
Work experience	1 3.8%	1 7.7%	0 0.0%	0 0.0%	2 5.4%	2 6.1%	0 0.0%	0 0.0%
Trustworthiness	18 69.2%	11 84.6%	16 59.3	33 94.3%	24 64.9%	25 75.8%	3 50.0%	9 52.9%
Aptitude	13 50.0%	2 15.4%	7 25.9%	7 20.0%	5 13.5%	8 24.2%	2 33.3%	8 47.1%
Age	14 6.2%	8 61.5%	10 37.0%	21 60.0%	18 48.7%	15 45.5%	4 66.7%	7 41.2%
Other	8 30.8%	3 23.1%	6 22.2%	6 17.1%	7 18.9%	6 18.2%	2 33.3%	4 23.5%

Of interest here, is that so few of the child carers (only half) regarded trustworthiness as an issue. In answering other questions, the owners/managers also mentioned a range of characteristics that they would want to find in an apprentice they selected. These included health, sanity, strength, energy. While some wanted a completed primary school level of education, most were only interested in basic literacy and numeracy.

Of those businesses which did not currently have apprentices, 37.5% said they would be willing to take on apprentices in the future, while 62.5% said they would not, citing the following reasons:

**Table 4.11: Reasons for Not Taking Apprentices**

Reason	Percentage
Not customary in this trade	29.4%
Difficult to find	16.5%
Too much trouble	14.1%
No need	8.2%
Just started in the business	22.4%
They would become potential competitors	7.1%
Too costly	3.4%
Other	9.4%

Reasons not to take on apprentices, disaggregated by trade, were as follows:

**Table 4.12: Reasons for Not Taking Apprentices by Trade**

	Masons	Caterers	Tailors	Welders	Mechanics	Carpenters	Child carers	Hair-dressers
Not customary in this trade	6.3%	21.7%	20.0%	0.0%	20.0%	0.0%	30.6%	16.0%
Difficult to find	0.0%	4.3%	20.0%	0.0%	40.0%	0.0%	11.1%	16.0%
Too much trouble	18.8%	8.7%	13.3%	14.3%	20.0%	0.0%	2.7%	8.0%
No need	0.0%	4.3%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	8.3%	0.0%
Just started the business	12.5%	8.7%	6.7%	42.9%	20.0%	22.2%	5.6%	6.0%
They would become potential competitors	12.5%	0.0%	6.7%	0.0%	0.0%	11.1%	2.7%	4.0%
Too costly	0.0%	0.0%	13.3%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	5.6%	0.0%
Other	0	0.7%	33.3%	0.0%	20.0%	0.0%	2.7%	0.0%

Among the “other” here were small profit margins, lack of equipment, fear of losing customer confidence and fear that machines might get damaged.

How does the arrangement between the apprentice and the business get formalised?  
The vast majority of agreements are verbal:

**Traditional Apprenticeship Practice in Dar Es Salaam: A Study (1999)**

**Table 4.13: Form of Agreement**

Form of agreement	Percentage
Verbal agreement	74.2%
Written agreement	11.8%
No agreement	13.9%
Other	0.1%

It is questionable whether the “no agreement” response constitutes apprenticeship at all, as the relationship should be characterised by some form of agreed-upon reciprocity. Masons were more likely than any other trade not to have any form of agreement, while child carers were most likely to have a written agreement. In the Masvingo, Zimbabwe, study, over 50% of the agreements were written, again suggesting a more sophisticated practice than that in Dar es Salaam.

**Table 4.14: Form of Agreement by Trade**

	Verbal	Written	None	Other
Masons	61.5%	3.8%	34.6%	0.0%
Caterers	85.7%	14.3%	0.0%	0.0%
Tailors	64.3%	21.4%	14.3%	0.0%
Welders	78.4%	8.1%	13.5%	0.0%
Mechanics	82.9%	11.4%	5.7%	0.0%
Carpenters	71.9%	9.4%	15.6%	3.1%
Child carers	57.1%	42.9%	0.0%	0.0%
Hairdressers	81.3%	6.3%	12.5%	0.0%

Contributions from the apprentice to the business, in return for acquiring skills, were given as follows:

**Table 4.15: Contributions made by Apprentices**

Contributions	Percentage
Contributions of materials	11.3%
Payment in cash	18.6%
Bondage	27.3%
No contributions	44.8%
Others	5.7%

The 44.8% here hides the real *quid pro quo* - the apprentice works for the business for nothing.

The breakdown in trades is shown in the following table where the contributions of apprentices by trade is calculated out of the number in that trade that have had apprentices.

**Table 4.16: Contributions of Apprentices by Trade**

	Materials		Payments		Bondage		None		Other	
	No	%	No	%	No	%	No	%	No	%
Masons	1	3.8%	2	7.7%	10	38.5%	14	53.8%	1	3.8%
Caterers	1	7.7%	0	0.0%	3	23.1%	10	76.9%	0	0.0%
Tailors	5	18.5%	17	63.0%	5	18.5%	3	11.1%	2	7.4%
Welders	1	2.9%	2	5.7%	12	34.3%	22	62.9%	2	5.7%
Mechanics	9	24.3%	5	13.5%	11	29.7%	11	29.7%	2	5.4%
Carpenters	5	15.2%	7	21.2%	6	18.2%	14	42.4%	2	6.1%
Child carers	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	2	33.3%	4	66.7%	0	0.0%
Hairdressers	0	0.0%	3	17.6%	4	23.5%	9	52.9%	2	11.8%

Masons, caterers, welders, child carers and hairdressers were more likely not to ask for any contribution from the apprentice than they were to ask for a contribution. When they did expect something, it was, most commonly, bondage (an agreed-upon time commitment). Most of the tailors in the sample of those who had had apprentices expected to be paid by the apprentice or his/her family, but amounts were small, mostly in the region of Tsh 2 000 to Tsh 3 000 per month, with a few going as high as Tsh 20 000 or Tsh 24 000. For car mechanics, both the expectation that the apprentice would purchase his/her own materials (materials are

expensive in this trade) and some form of bondage were common. While a large minority of carpenters expected nothing, when they did expect something it could be materials, payments or bondage.

With regard to what the business gives to the apprentice, the following answers were given:

**Table 4.17: Contribution of Business to Apprentice**

Contribution	Percentage
Shelter	2.1%
Food	65.9%
Payment in cash	30.9%
Nothing	17.0%
Other	25.8%

Clearly, a number of apprentices work in return for food and, hopefully, learning a skill.

Looked at by trade, the picture is as follows:

**Table 4.18: Contribution of Business to Apprentice by Trade**

	Shelter		Food		Payments		Nothing		Other	
	No	%	No	%	No	%	No	%	No	%
Masons	1	3.8%	15	57.7%	15	57.7%	1	3.8%	7	26.9%
Caterers	0	0.0%	12	92.3%	4	30.8%	1	7.7%	6	46.2%
Tailors	1	3.7%	14	51.9%	4	14.8%	11	40.7%	6	22.2%
Welders	1	2.9%	24	68.6%	11	31.4%	6	17.1%	11	31.4%
Mechanics	0	0.0%	24	64.9%	10	27.0%	5	13.5%	8	21.6%
Carpenters	0	0.0%	21	63.6%	11	33.3%	5	15.2%	8	24.2%
Child carers	1	16.7%	5	83.3%	2	33.3%	0	0.0%	2	33.3%
Hairdressers	0	0.0%	11	64.7%	3	17.6%	0	0.0%	2	11.8%

Masons were more likely than any of the other trades to provide payments, although payments, across trades, were for very small amounts, in the region of Tsh 1 000 to Tsh 2 000 a day was considered generous. Some simply said they gave pocket

money “when business is good”.<sup>1</sup> Tailors, the most likely to ask for payment, were the least likely to provide payments and this may be because they see themselves as selling training.

For those who did have agreements, other things included were:

**Table 4.19: Other Items in Agreements**

Other conditions in agreement	Percentage
Duration of training	28.9%
Certification	2.1%
Working hours	38.1%
Holidays	5.2%
Health and safety provisions	13.9%
Other	2.6%

Tailors were the most likely to offer certification, although the numbers were small. They were also the most likely (55.6%<sup>2</sup>) to specify a time limit in the agreement. This ties in with the theory that they are the most likely to see themselves as selling training in the form of a training course. The only other trade categories that offered certification at all were welders and mechanics. Working hours were quite commonly included in the agreements, but car mechanics were least likely to include them (21.6%), and child carers most likely (50.0%).

The ISTARN, Zimbabwe, experience has shown that, where there are interventions in the traditional practice, it is best not to interfere in the agreement between the business and the apprentice which, in fact, forms the core of the apprenticeship relationship (hence the emphasis on trustworthiness - there needs to be mutual liking and trust for the relationship to work). Initially, in the ISTARN TAP, ISTARN actually found “masters” for the would-be apprentices, and paid a small amount to the apprentice as a subsistence grant, as well as offering the enterprise owners free services. ISTARN found that this led to the apprentices depending on ISTARN rather than the “master”. This created problems between the “master” and the apprentice which both then expected ISTARN to solve. At the same time, the incentives to the enterprise owners created a false market for “ISTARN apprentices”. Now ISTARN expects would-be apprentices to find their own “masters”, and to negotiate a contract with them as they would in the traditional practice.

<sup>1</sup>“Other” mostly referred to small amounts to cover things such as bus fare or “money for soap”.

<sup>2</sup>Percentages here are of the total number of respondents in a trade who said that they did have formal agreements.

#### 4.4 ENDING APPRENTICESHIP AND LIFE AFTER APPRENTICESHIP

As one of the reasons for exploring the traditional apprenticeship practice is that it is seen as a form vocational training that leads to employment or self-employment, it was important to look at the current status of the full group of 1 350 who had been apprenticed to the respondents over the past five years.

**Table 4.20: Current Status of All Apprentices by Gender**

	Male	Female	Total
Still in apprenticeship	44.1%	30.0%	41.2%
Finished apprenticeship (fate unknown)	20.7%	36.1%	23.9%
Employed in the business after apprenticeship	4.3%	1.4%	3.7%
Still in business now	1.4%	4.6%	2.1%
Now unemployed	1.5%	4.6%	2.1%
Set up businesses in similar trade	18.2%	11.1%	16.7%
Set up businesses in a different trade	1.6%	2.9%	1.9%
Found jobs in formal businesses in same trade	0.1%	0.0%	0.1%
Found jobs in an informal business in the same trade	6.6%	8.2%	7.0%
Found jobs in an informal business in a different trade	1.5%	1.1%	1.4%
TOTAL	100%	100%	100%

When these figures are presented for only those apprentices who have completed their apprenticeship, they look like this:

**Table 4.21: Current Status of all Apprentices who have Completed their Apprenticeship by Gender**

	Males (% of total males)	Females (% of total females)	Total (% of males and females together)
Finished apprenticeship (fate unknown)	221 37.0%	101 51.5%	322 40.6%
Employed in the business after apprenticeship	46 7.7%	4 2.0%	50 6.3%
Still in business now	15 2.5%	13 6.6%	28 3.5%
Now unemployed	16 2.7%	13 6.6%	29 3.7%

Set up business in a similar trade	195 32.6%	31 15.8%	226 28.5%
Set up business in a different trade	17 2.8%	8 4.1%	25 3.1%
Found jobs in a formal business in same trade	1 0.2%	0 0.0%	1 0.1%
Found jobs in an informal business in the same trade	71 11.9%	23 11.7%	94 11.8%
Found jobs in an informal business in a different trade	16 2.7%	3 1.5%	19 2.4%
TOTAL	598 100.0%	196 100.0%	794 100.0%

Although one needs to know more about the “lost” category of “fate unknown”, it is possible to see from these tables that at least 16.7% of the total number of apprentices (in fact, 28.5 % of those who are no longer in apprenticeship) have set up their own businesses in the trade taught. We can also see that men are more likely to be kept on in the business after the apprenticeship than are women, that a higher percentage of women are likely to end up unemployed after apprenticeship, that more men are likely to set up their own businesses. The only category where men and women are proportionately quite equal is in finding employment in other informal businesses. From this, one can conclude that the traditional practice works better for men than it does for women. Given the concern of development agencies for improving gender equity, this would be an area that needed serious consideration in any attempt at an intervention into the traditional practice.

Disaggregated by trade, the destinies of former apprentices were given as follows:

**Table 4.22: Current Status of Former Apprentices by Trade**

	Masons	Caterers	Tailors	Welders	Mechanics	Carpenters	Child carers	Hair-dressers
Finished apprenticeship (fate unknown)	40 30.1%	9 21.4%	138 61.6%	49 43.4%	51 35.7%	30 26.8%	1 12.5%	4 21.1%
Employed in the business after apprenticeship	7 5.3%	8 19.0%	4 1.8%	6 5.3%	12 8.4%	11 9.8%	2 25.0%	0 0.0%
Still in the business now	1 0.8%	8 19.0%	3 1.3%	4 3.5%	4 2.8%	3 2.7%	2 25.0%	3 15.8%
Now unemployed	6 4.5%	3 7.1%	8 3.6%	0 0.0%	2 1.4%	6 5.4%	0 0.0%	4 21.1%
Set up business in a similar trade	64 48.1%	7 16.7%	41 18.3%	36 31.9%	49 34.3%	26 23.2%	0 0.0%	3 15.8%
Set up business in a different trade	2 1.5%	0 0.0%	6 2.7%	9 8.0%	6 4.2%	0 0.0%	1 12.5%	1 5.3%

**Traditional Apprenticeship Practice in Dar Es Salaam: A Study (1999)**



Found jobs in a formal business in the same trade	0 0.0%	0 0.0%	0 0.0%	0 0.0%	1 0.7%	0 0.0%	0 0.0%	0 0.0%
Found jobs in an in-formal business in the same trade	13 9.8%	7 16.7%	22 9.8%	9 8.0%	5 3.5%	34 30.4%	0 0.0%	4 21.1%
Found jobs in an in-formal business in a different trade	0 0.0%	0 0.0%	2 0.9%	0 0.0%	13 9.1%	2 1.8%	2 25.0%	0 0.0%

This tells us that masons have the highest success rate, as far as we know, in self employment (48.1%), followed by car mechanics (34.3%), welders (31.9%) and carpenters (23.2%). Thus, those apprenticed in the traditionally male trades appear to have a better chance of self-employment than those apprentices in the traditionally female trades. None of the child care apprentices whose fate was known had set up his or her own child care business, but they had a better chance of being employed in the same business after apprenticeship than most.<sup>3</sup> Unemployment was particularly high among hairdressers and also higher among caterers. The figures for self-employment among hairdressers also confounded the assumption that this was an easy trade in which to set oneself up in business (only 15.8%).<sup>4</sup> Carpenters were the most likely to find wage employment in the informal sector, followed by hairdressers and caterers.

The average length of apprenticeship, overall, was as follows:

**Table 4.23: Average Length of Apprenticeship**

Length of apprenticeship	Percentage
Under 3 months	9.8%
3-6 months	14.9%
6-9 months	17.5%
9-12 months	27.8%
1-2 years	26.8%
3-5 years	5.2%

<sup>3</sup>The numbers here are very small.

<sup>4</sup>Again, this finding must be modified by the fact that there were few hairdressing apprentices overall.

It is interesting to compare these percentages with the answers given to the question as to how long an apprentice takes to learn the skills s/he needs to fulfil workplace requirements independently:

**Table 4.24: Time Needed to Work Independently (“master” assessment)**

Length of apprenticeship	Percentage
3-6 months	17.0%
6-9 months	11.9%
9-12 months	24.2%
1-2 years	44.8%
Over 2 years	3.1%

Overall, enterprise owners/managers seem to believe that the apprentices still have something to learn after their apprenticeship is complete. By trade, the only exception to this was car mechanics, where respondents seemed to feel that the apprenticeship time was appropriate to the learning of the skills and workplace requirements. In the shorter apprenticeships, it may well be that, even when the technical skills of the trade have been learned, there is much about running the business that still needs to be learned.

In three of the trades (catering, child care and hairdressing) apprenticeships were generally nine months or less. Masonry was the only other trade where a sizeable proportion (46.1%) of apprenticeships were nine months or less. A high proportion of masons (34.6%) and hairdressers (35.3%) thought that the trades could be learned in under three months. Car mechanics had the longest apprenticeships, with 45.1% of apprenticeships being one year or more, and 17.1% between three and five years.<sup>5</sup>

---

<sup>5</sup>In the ISTARN, Zimbabwe, experience, the first three intakes of the TAP were made up of carpenters, welders and car mechanics. The apprenticeship period for the carpenters and welders was three to six months, but, for the car mechanics, up to 18 months. There is a strong school of thought among international experts on traditional apprenticeship programmes that, to ensure costeffectiveness, apprenticeships need to be as short as possible and that 18 months is too long. By such standards, masonry and hairdressing would be obvious choices for a traditional apprenticeship programme, but other factors also need to be taken into account. So, for example, the reluctance of hairdressers to take on apprentices for the very reason that the trade can be learned quickly and a business set up easily, makes it a problematic choice. Figures on how successful the car mechanic apprentices in the ISTARN programme are after apprenticeship are, unfortunately, not yet available.

**Table 4.25: Average Length of Apprenticeship by Trade**

	<b>Under 3 months</b>	<b>3 - 6 months</b>	<b>6 - 9 months</b>	<b>9 - 12 months</b>	<b>1 - 2 years</b>	<b>3 - 5 years</b>
Masons	34.6%	3.8%	7.7%	26.9%	26.9%	0.0%
Caterers	7.1%	50.0%	28.6%	0.0%	14.3%	0.0%
Tailors	3.3%	6.7%	20.0%	36.7%	30.0%	3.3%
Welders	2.8%	11.1%	16.7%	33.3%	36.1%	0.0%
Mechanics	0.0%	11.4%	8.6%	34.3%	28.6%	17.1%
Carpenters	0.0%	12.1%	18.2%	33.3%	27.3%	9.1%
Child carers	14.3%	14.3%	28.6%	14.3%	28.6%	0.0%
Hairdressers	35.3%	35.3%	29.4%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%

While the following gives some indication of what respondents saw as a “completed” apprenticeship, all the interviewers noted that this was a “grey” area, rather than a clear conclusion. This may be because, in fact, the enterprise owners/managers believe that the apprentices still have much to learn, even when they are supposedly finished. It also seems that, in the Tanzanian practice, apprentices may leave a particular “master” and go to another enterprise because they feel they have learned all that they can in the first placement.<sup>6</sup> Several respondents said that they were not “strict” about duration.

**Table 4.26: Mark of Completion**

<b>Mark of completion</b>	<b>Percentage</b>
Fixed time schedule	6.7%
Skill test	90.2%
Money/gift to enterprise owner	4.1%
Other	6.7%

The prevalence of a skills test as a mark of completion (an informal one, devised by the enterprise owners) cut across all trades. This is not surprising as “testing” is the norm in the formal sector, and these informal tests can be seen as the informal sector equivalent of trade testing. The problem is that the enterprise owners/managers probably do not have a clear picture in their own heads, or, at any rate, each enterprise owner/manager probably has a different picture in his/her head, of what an

---

<sup>6</sup>“There is no agreement - when she has skills she will have to go.”

appropriate test should be. Quite a few of the enterprise owners/managers also talked about continuous assessment, and a few said “when the apprentice is satisfied”, or “when s/he is working confidently and independently”.

#### 4.5 SUMMARY

From the findings of this Section, one can conclude that the practice of traditional apprenticeship is fairly widespread in all the trades surveyed, except child care, but more particularly in the traditionally male-dominated trades, and in tailoring. Although tailors still take on apprentices, the practice seems less common in the trade than it has been in the past, and there is some evidence to suggest that enterprise owners/managers in tailoring are increasingly seeing themselves as selling training in a “course” type format. In absolute and proportional terms, car mechanics have the most apprentices, although less than half of the owners/managers of car mechanic enterprises in the sample felt that there was a demand for their goods or services. This highlights a concern in the traditional apprenticeship practice, namely that, unlike Zimbabwe, the practice is not necessarily demand-driven.

There were more men than women apprentices which is to be expected given that the enterprises most likely to employ apprentices are male-dominated. In trades which were traditionally seen as female-dominated, but which are increasingly taking on a male ownership profile (such as tailoring, catering and child care), female apprentices still predominate, suggesting that women are likely to be found at the bottom level of employment in the informal sector, as in the formal.

The overwhelming majority of enterprise owners/managers give as their reason for taking on apprentices “to help young people get a start in life”. The only other reasons given in any significant numbers are “to get extra help” and “to expand the business”. Caterers and child carers seem to be the most likely to be looking for extra help. Trustworthiness is the most important selection factor cited, followed by age, and then education. A “good” age seems to be around 16, and one respondent said: *“Old people cannot secure the chance”*. The emphasis on levels of education seems to reflect a growing concern about falling levels of basic education around numeracy and literacy, which are regarded as almost the only “required” skills for being taken on as an apprentice.

A fairly high percentage of those businesses which do not currently have apprentices are not considering taking on apprentices (62.5%).

Verbal agreements are by far the most common form of agreement (74.2%). This was not the case in a similar study done in Masvingo, Zimbabwe, where by far the majority were written, and confirms our perception that the traditional apprenticeship practice is far less sophisticated in Dar es Salaam than in Zimbabwe. Relatively few (30.9%) of enterprise owners/managers provide payment in cash to their apprentices, with payment in food being far more common (65.9%).

There is a relatively high success rate, judged by the number of apprentices setting themselves up in business in the trade learned (28.5% of those who have completed apprenticeship, with a further 40.6% whose fate is unknown). Men are more likely than women to succeed in this way, with masons being the most successful, followed by car mechanics and welders. There is a lack of clarity about what exactly constitutes completion of an apprenticeship, but most enterprise owners/managers opt for some form of skills testing, set individually.

## SECTION 5: ATTITUDE OF ENTERPRISE OWNERS TO TRAINING

From the point of view of GTZ/VETA, it was most important to find out what the attitude of the enterprise owners/managers was towards training, and what training would be appropriate.

### 5.1 TRAINING NEEDS

The enterprise owners/managers rated the importance of skills, other than direct trade skills, in their enterprises as follows:

**Table 5.1: Rating of Importance of Skills and Self-Assessment of Skills of Owner/Managers**

	Very important	Important	Not important	Skills of EO/ Manager
Calculating and numeracy	258 78.2%	34 10.3%	38 11.5%	263 79.7%
Writing and reading	232 70.3%	77 23.3%	21 6.4%	290 87.9%
Negotiating with suppliers and customers	170 51.5%	120 36.4%	32 9.7%	241 73.0%
Training people	69 20.9%	100 30.3%	193 58.5%	202 61.2%
Applying for and managing credit	106 32.1%	99 30.0%	125 37.9%	66 20.0%
Advertising and presentation of products	129 39.1%	121 36.7%	79 23.9%	128 38.8%
Keeping written accounts	172 52.1%	125 37.9%	33 10.0%	182 55.2%
Costing the product	149 45.2%	138 41.8%	43 13.0%	180 54.5%
Use of new machines	135 40.9%	126 38.2%	69 20.9%	151 45.8%
Use of new materials	136 41.2%	146 44.2%	48 14.5%	161 48.8%
Maintaining the machines	128 38.8%	109 33.0%	93 28.2%	128 38.8%
Organising production	180 54.5%	109 33.0%	41 12.4%	213 64.5%
Other	12 3.6%	1 0.3%	0 0.0%	17 5.2%

The table highlights that there are a number of areas which are considered relatively important, but in which the owners/managers do not believe they have skills. So, while 62.1% of the sample rated "Applying for and managing credit" as important or very important, only 20% thought they had such skills. Similarly, only about half the number of people who rated "Advertising and presentation of products" as important or very important, believed that they had these skills. Significant numbers who rated "Keeping written accounts" and "Costing the product" also did not believe that they

**Traditional Apprenticeship Practice in Dar Es Salaam: A Study (1999)**

had these skills. Caterers and hairdressers neither thought that training was important, nor did many of them claim to have training skills.<sup>7</sup> Car mechanics and welders, on the other hand, both thought that training was important, and were more confident that they had the skill of training, than were owners/managers in the other trades. Some trades exhibited scores lower than the norm in certain areas, but this was understandable because of the nature of the trade - child care owners/managers neither valued nor felt they had machine-related skills, for example. Hairdressers, on the other hand, rated use of machinery very high (many of them use hair dyes) in terms of value, and felt that they had the necessary skills, on the whole. They rated lower than the norm, however, on the ability to maintain machinery.

Respondents were also asked where they had acquired additional skills, if they had them<sup>8</sup>:

**Table 5.2: Source of Skill Acquisition**

	At school	At a training course	During apprenticeship in a large business	During apprenticeship in a business like my own	On the job	Other
Calculating and numeracy	150 45.5%	20 6.1%	4 1.2%	50 15.2%	19 5.8%	0 0.0%
Writing and reading	266 80.6%	2 0.6%	0 0.0%	1 0.3%	1 0.3%	0 0.0%
Negotiating with suppliers and customers	1 0.3%	16 4.8%	9 2.7%	66 20.0%	133 40.3%	0 0.0%
Training people	13 3.9%	18 5.5%	8 2.4%	42 12.7%	116 35.2%	0 0.0%
Applying for and managing credit	4 1.2%	12 3.6%	2 0.6%	32 9.7%	21 6.4%	0 0.0%
Advertising and presentation of products	4 1.2%	5 1.5%	3 0.9%	34 10.3%	84 25.5%	1 0.3%
Keeping written accounts	45 13.6%	19 5.8%	4 1.2%	29 8.8%	79 23.9%	0 0.0%
Costing the product	7 2.1%	27 8.2%	10 3.0%	48 14.5%	84 25.5%	0 0.0%
Use of new machines	5 1.5%	34 10.3%	10 3.0%	42 12.7%	48 14.5%	2 0.6%
Use of new materials	3 0.9%	32 9.7%	10 3.0%	45 13.6%	55 16.7%	1 0.3%

<sup>7</sup>Said one caterer: "I didn't consider proper training important as most of us women can easily cope with kitchen work."

<sup>8</sup>Figures here are calculated as a percentage of the total number of respondents who said they had a particular skill.

Maintaining the machines	7 2.1%	22 6.7%	8 2.4%	28 8.5%	59 17.9%	2 0.6%
Organising production	8 2.4%	22 6.7%	3 0.9%	41 12.4%	115 34.8%	1 0.3%
Other	1 0.3%	5 1.5%	2 0.6%	0 0.0%	4 1.2%	1 0.3%

The analysis shows that most of the owners/managers acquired their own business skills, apart from calculating and numeracy, and reading and writing, which they acquired at school, from some form of informal apprenticeship/on the job process. Very few acquired the skills from a formal apprenticeship or at a training course. In fact, most people said that they had acquired business skills on the job rather than during an informal apprenticeship. This may be because of the limited ability of self-taught people to transfer such skills during an apprenticeship, or because of the grey line that appears to separate apprenticeship and on the job learning in Tanzania.

However, further analysis did show that in three of the four trades<sup>9</sup> where apprenticeship was more common as a practice (tailors, welders, carpenters, mechanics), there were areas where a higher percentage of respondents said that they had learned the skills during apprenticeship rather than on the job. This was particularly marked with mechanics with more mechanics claiming to have learned many of their skills (negotiating with suppliers and customers, training people, applying for and managing credit, advertising and presentation of products, keeping written accounts, use of new machines, use of new materials, maintaining the machines) as apprentices rather than on the job.

The respondents were also asked what skills (other than trade skills) they would teach their apprentices. In most traditional apprenticeship practice, part of the process of skills transfer is the transfer of business-related skills, as opposed to strictly trade or craft skills. Of the respondents, 68.6% said they would teach their apprentices skills in negotiating with suppliers and customers, 49.5% said they would teach them skills related to advertising and presentation of products, 49.5% said they would teach them to keep written accounts, 62.9% said they would teach them to cost products, 55.3% said they would teach them skills related to the use of machinery and new materials, and 61.3% said they would teach them how to organise the production process.

Asked if there was anything related to his/her current activity that he/she would like to learn or to improve, the owners/managers gave the following answers:

---

<sup>9</sup>The number of carpenter respondents who said that they had learned their skills from either their apprenticeship or on the job was negligible.



**Table 5.3: Areas Needing Improvement or More Learning (Respondents)**

Learning area	Percentage
Craft skills	54.8%
Management skills	26.1%
Finance and accounts	33.3%
Marketing skills	45.8%
Literacy/numeracy skills	4.8%
None	5.5%
Other (e.g. English, Business English, use of modern machines, technical subjects, car painting)	13.6%

When they were asked why they had not yet undertaken such training, they answered as follows:

**Table 5.4: Reasons for Not Undertaking Training**

Reason	Percentage
No such training available	9.1%
No time for training	10.9%
Do not have entry qualifications	1.5%
Too far away	0.9%
At the wrong hours	18.2%
Too costly/financial constraints	69.1%
No reason at all	5.2%
Other	11.5%

“Too costly/financial constraints” was by the far the most often cited reason across all the trades. More than 57% of the respondents in any of the trades cited it, rising to as high as 81% of the car mechanics. Between 14.3% and 19.4% in any one trade cited “at the wrong hours”, with this reason appearing to be most common for masons, tailors, welders and hairdressers. A relatively high percentage of masons (16.7%) and mechanics (14.3%) also said that they had “no time for training”, and there was a general concern that taking time out for training meant losing time for earning a living.<sup>10</sup> One respondent equated training with formal training and said there was no point because, “even after graduation, there is no employment opportunity or self-

<sup>10</sup>“Attending courses out of the job means failure to sustain life.”

employment”, a quote which speaks to the heart of what Grierson means by the “crisis of relevance”. Clearly, however, cost is perceived as the major barrier.

**Table 5.5: Training Needs of Respondents by Trade**

	<b>Craft skills</b>	<b>Management skills</b>	<b>Finance and accounts</b>	<b>Marketing skills</b>	<b>Literacy/ numeracy skills</b>	<b>None</b>	<b>Other</b>
Masons	30 71.4%	11 26.2%	16 38.1%	21 50.0%	2 4.8%	2 4.8%	5 11.9%
Caterers	18 50.0%	10 27.8%	15 41.7%	20 55.6%	3 8.3%	4 11.1%	3 8.3%
Tailors	22 52.4%	9 21.4%	10 23.8%	26 61.9%	1 2.4%	3 7.1%	4 9.5%
Welders	26 61.9%	10 23.8%	17 40.5%	21 50.0%	1 2.4%	3 7.1%	5 11.9%
Mechanics	25 59.5%	6 14.3%	9 21.4%	16 38.1%	1 2.4%	1 2.4%	9 21.4%
Carpenters	24 57.1%	7 16.7%	20 47.6%	21 50.0%	1 2.4%	2 4.8%	6 14.3%
Child carers	14 33.3%	24 57.1%	12 28.6%	9 21.4%	7 16.7%	1 2.4%	4 9.5%
Hairdressers	22 52.4%	9 21.4%	11 26.2%	17 40.5%	0 0.0%	2 4.8%	9 21.4%

With the exception of child care enterprise owners/managers, the majority of the respondents in each trade believed they still had something to learn about their trade. Child care managers were far more concerned to learn management skills, and were, in fact (see Section 3.1), mostly managers and not owners. The general emphasis on marketing corroborates the importance of marketing as reflected in the rating of problems experienced in the past and currently by businesses (Section 3.2). Surprisingly, a relatively high percentage of child care business owner/managers wanted more literacy and numeracy skills. The sort of additional skills wanted by the hairdressers were in the area of beautician skills and could be seen as extended craft skills. For mechanics, it was welding and body part fixing, again, an extension of craft skills.

While most enterprise owners/managers with apprentices were prepared to send them to a training course (51.2%), the majority expected an apprentice to pay for him/herself. “Too costly/financial constraints” was also the reason most often cited for apprentices not undertaking training, across the trades, although it seems to be seen as less of a problem by tailors (19.0%), child carers (7.1%) and hairdressers (9.5%).

In terms of skills that owner/managers think apprentices need, the breakdown was:

**Table 5.6: Areas Needing Improvement or More Learning (Apprentices)**

Learning area	Percentage
Craft skills	64.9%
Management skills	18.0%
Finance and accounts	27.3%
Marketing skills	40.7%
Literacy/numeracy skills	16.5%
None	6.2%
Other	9.8%

There are certainly areas where businesses would like to see their apprentices learning more or improving. By trade, the analysis of apprentice training needs looks like this:

**Table 5.7: Analysis of Apprentice Training Needs by Trade**

	Craft skills	Management skills	Finance and accounts	Marketing skills	Literacy/numeracy skills	None	Other
Masons	24 92.3%	4 15.4%	8 30.8%	14 53.8%	2 7.7%	1 3.8%	1 3.8%
Caterers	6 46.2%	2 15.4%	5 38.5%	4 30.8%	3 23.1%	0 0.0%	3 23.1%
Tailors	14 51.9%	6 22.2%	9 33.3%	15 55.6%	8 29.6%	1 3.7%	0 0.0%
Welders	25 71.4%	11 31.4%	9 25.7%	14 40.0%	7 20.0%	2 5.7%	3 8.6%
Mechanics	23 62.2%	1 2.7%	4 10.8%	6 16.2%	4 10.8%	4 10.8%	5 13.5%
Carpenters	22 66.7%	5 15.2%	11 33.3%	16 48.5%	4 12.1%	2 6.1%	3 9.1%
Child carers	3 50.0%	3 50.0%	2 33.3%	1 16.7%	1 16.7%	1 16.7%	1 16.7%
Hairdressers	9 52.9%	3 17.6%	5 29.4%	9 52.9%	3 17.6%	1 5.9%	3 17.6%

There were a number of trades where a relatively high proportion of the owners/managers thought that their apprentices needed literacy and numeracy skills. These included caterers, tailors and welders (all 20% or more). The proportion of owners/managers that thought their apprentices needed craft skills was over 50% in all the trades except caterers, and was particularly high for masons. Except for child care businesses, management skills were generally rated as a low priority for apprentices. In a number of cases, finance and accounts skills were seen as more important.

**Traditional Apprenticeship Practice in Dar Es Salaam: A Study (1999)**

When the needs of the respondents and their perception of the needs of the apprentices are put side-by-side, they look like this:

**Table 5.8: Analysis of Owner/Manager and Apprentice Needs for Improvement of Skills**

	<b>Respondent<sup>1</sup></b>	<b>Apprentice<sup>2</sup></b>
Craft Skills	54.8%	64.9%
Management Skills	26.1%	18.0%
Finance and accounts	33.3%	27.3%
Marketing skills	45.8%	40.7%
Literacy/numeracy skills	4.8%	16.5%
None	5.5%	6.2%
Other	13.6%	9.8%

The only areas where the respondents believe that their apprentices are more in need of training than they are themselves are craft skills (the skills of the trade) and literacy and numeracy. The perception that apprentices need literacy and numeracy skills far more than do the enterprise owners/managers seems to reflect an experience of declining educational standards. Although it was only in catering that the owners/managers believed themselves to be more in need of skills training than their apprentices, the differences were not as great as one would have expected. This seems to reflect a general lack of conviction among the owners/managers about their own skills. It is not that they think that the apprentices have more skills than they have but rather that they feel that they need to improve their own skills in order to be able to offer the apprentices appropriate training in the area.

## **5.2 ABILITY AND WILLINGNESS TO PAY FOR TRAINING**

The most frequently cited reason for not undertaking training was that it was too costly or that the owner/manager had financial constraints (69.1%). International literature warns of the dangers of providing training free of charge. By doing so, the intervening agency contradicts the imperatives of supply-driven, rather than demand-driven training. There must be some mechanism for ensuring that the training offered is really wanted and needed by the beneficiary. This requires that s/he prioritises the training above other needs, and expecting some form of financial investment is the best way of ensuring this.

<sup>1</sup>Whole sample of 330 owners/managers were asked this question.

<sup>2</sup>Only those businesses that had had apprentices in the last five years (194 businesses) were asked this question.

Enterprise owners/managers were asked how much they would be prepared to pay for a training course for themselves and for their apprentices. They found this a difficult question. Many of them said, sensibly enough, that it would depend on the content and duration of the training. Many said that, although they were prepared to pay for themselves, they were not prepared to pay for their apprentices (*“Why should we pay when he will just leave us?”*) The average amount suggested, where people were prepared to pay and gave figures<sup>3</sup>, was Tsh 16 000, but the range was from Tsh 20 to Tsh 650 000.

Currently, it appears, enterprise owners/managers do not see training as their greatest need. If training is identified as being crucial to increasing their productivity and profitability, then it may be necessary to find a way to convince them that this is the case. One option is to provide the training free initially. But this is problematic - once training has been offered free, it is very difficult to charge for it later, and making it too easy to access, in any case, usually leads to it being devalued by the recipient. It also compromises the principle that services offered in the informal business sector should be offered in a businesslike and demand-led way. One way that has been suggested for avoiding such pitfalls, is to offer carefully targeted training, to a particular target group, as a prize, either on a random basis (e.g. raffle the training for a small sum), or on a merit basis (e.g. in a competition for “best products”). The latter option has the additional advantage of emphasising quality through its very format.

### 5.3 SUMMARY

From the findings reflected in this Section, one can conclude that the informal sector enterprise owners/managers in the sample do identify training needs, but that they see cost as an insuperable barrier to meeting these needs. Read in conjunction with the findings of Section 3, this seems to indicate that training is not seen as a priority by them.

---

<sup>3</sup>Two hundred out of the 330 respondents (60.6%).

## SECTION 6: SOME CONCLUSIONS

### 6.1 INTRODUCTION

We went into this exercise of surveying selected trades in the informal sector in Dar es Salaam with the specific intention of assessing the practice of traditional apprenticeship with a view to designing a vocational education intervention related to the practice, that would add value to the traditional practice, without interfering excessively in it.

Our investigation was premised on certain assumptions:

- ∇ That the practice existed;
- ∇ That its value lay in the fact that it often led to self-employment in a relatively short time, one of the expectations of VET in an informal sector setting;
- ∇ That the practice was demand-driven i.e. that apprentices chose to be apprentices in trades where they could expect to make a living in future, and that enterprise owners took on apprentices because they needed extra capacity, so there was mutual gain;
- ∇ That there was potential, through adding value to the practice, to assist women improve their situation in the informal sector, where, as in the formal sector, they tend to occupy the poorest paying levels;
- ∇ That training, in some form, was likely to be welcome and to enhance the practice.

### 6.2 FINDINGS

Among the interesting findings, pertinent to our purpose, were the following:

- ∇ Although the practice appears to be widespread, it exists in a fairly unsophisticated form, characterised by verbal rather than written agreements, a lack of clarity about the point at which an apprenticeship ends, and some “fuzziness” around the difference between apprentices, helpers and “hangers-on”. The lack of industrial activity in the country generally means that few of the owners/managers got their training in a formal setting, and there is little basis for modelling the apprenticeship on what happens in the formal sector in any way. Levels of formal training in the Tanzanian labour force are, in any case, low. Nevertheless, the owners/managers did see it as their responsibility to teach apprentices not only trade skills but also the skills of running a business, part of the traditional practice internationally. In a number of instances, they said they would teach their apprentices skills which many of them did not believe they themselves had.
- ∇ While, in the past, tailors have employed more apprentices than any of the other trades surveyed, and still do so, their percentage of the total number of apprentices is falling. There is evidence in the findings that tailors, more than

any of the other owners/managers, see themselves as offering a “training-for-a-fee” course, rather than apprenticeship.

- ∇ More than half the sample had had, and still had, apprentices, at an average of 4.1 apprentices per enterprise, far higher than in a comparable study in Masvingo, Zimbabwe. There is no relationship between demand for products and services, and the practice of taking on an apprentice. This is in contrast to the Masvingo, Zimbabwe, situation where the practice was demand-driven, enterprise owners taking on apprentices because they needed extra help to meet the work demand, and apprentices looking for placements where they could learn a trade with the potential to generate an income.
- ∇ Where success rate is measured in terms of the numbers setting up their own businesses in the trade learned after the apprenticeship, the internationally accepted criterion for VET in the informal sector, the apprentices in the survey are doing quite well without any intervention. Grierson (ibid) rates success as self-employment of at least one third of participants. Of those apprentices in this survey who have completed their apprenticeship, 28.5% have set up their own businesses in the trade learned, while the fate of a further 40.6% is unknown and may include others who have gone the entrepreneurial route.
- ∇ Although care was taken to include an equal number of traditionally male and traditionally female trades in the survey, only 23% of the businesses surveyed had female owners. There was evidence that ownership of tailoring, child care and catering enterprises was becoming increasingly male-dominated, although female apprentices in these enterprises continued to predominate, reinforcing the marginalisation of women, even within this traditionally marginalised sector. In addition, the traditionally male-dominated trades were more likely to take on apprentices, so that, over all, there were more male than female apprentices. Over a five year period, 79.3% of apprentices had been men, and only 20.7% had been women. The findings also showed that men were more likely to be kept on in a business once their apprenticeship was complete, that a higher percentage of women are likely to end up unemployed, and that more men are likely to set up their own businesses once apprenticeship is complete. The only category of “after apprenticeship” employment where men and women are proportionately equal is in finding employment in other informal sector businesses. The inescapable conclusion is that the traditional practice is not currently helping in any way to address issues of gender equity, and is helping to entrench inequity.
- ∇ Educational levels among owners/managers are low, with fewer than half having completed their O Levels. Those in child care and catering have the highest levels of education, and are most likely to have some additional vocational training. Proportionately, however, these two trades currently have the fewest apprentices. Owners/managers seemed to be concerned about basic levels of literacy and numeracy among apprentices, confirming that basic

educational levels are falling in Tanzania. Apprentices are generally young, with a substantial proportion (39.3%) being 18 years or younger.

∇ A high proportion of businesses (78.5%) had been in existence for more than a year, and 33% had been in existence for five years or more. Over the past two year period, the average number of permanent employees per business had gone from 1.1 to 1.8. In keeping with this, more than half the owners/managers believed that their businesses had expanded over the past two years. However, fewer than half the car mechanics, who currently have the highest number of apprentices, believed that their businesses had expanded, and only 38.1% said there was a demand for their products or services. The child care owners/managers rated demand more highly than any other trade, but they employ the lowest percentage of apprentices. While 50% of tailors and caterers also still believed there was a demand for their goods and services, catering businesses are the second lowest employers of apprentices, and the practice seems to be diminishing rather than rising among tailors. In all the other trades, fewer than 50% of the enterprise owners/managers believed that there was sufficient demand for their goods or services. Thus, it appears that the traditional apprenticeship practice, while prevalent in these trades, is built on quite shaky ground. If the low levels of perceived demand are actual, then either the economy has reached saturation point with regard to these trades, or the quality of products produced and services offered is so poor that enterprise owners are unable to sell their goods or there is so little economic activity, generally, that people do not have money to buy things. None of these explanations is a good predictor for a successful apprenticeship practice.<sup>1</sup>

∇ When enterprise owners/managers were asked to rate the problems they had experienced initially in their businesses, and those they were still experiencing, in terms of levels of difficulty, the problem areas that were rated in the top five (out of ten given), both initially and currently, were:

- 9 finding a plot;
- 9 financing;
- 9 license/registration;
- 9 tools, machines; and
- 9 marketing.

The needs for skills/know-how was rated tenth out of ten, both initially and currently. The owners/managers rated themselves very low on certain skills (only 20% thought they had skills in applying and managing credit, and only 38.8% thought they had skill in advertising and presentation of products, while 54.8% thought they needed skills in their craft or trade). In a number of cases, they acknowledged the importance of a skill, while many of them admitted that they did not have the skill. They had not, however, prioritised the need for

---

<sup>1</sup>One of the car mechanics interviewed said there was “no need for skill” in his trade. On that basis, one wonders what sort of service he offers.



training. Sixty-nine percent gave as the reason for not having undertaken such training, financial constraints or the training being too costly. The overwhelming majority of those who said they had particular skills had acquired them through informal apprenticeship or on the job (in an informal sector rather than formal sector job).

The ranking of priorities in this study accords with that done in the 1995 Survey of the informal sector in Dar es Salaam where the main challenges for the informal sector were identified as being access to credit and markets, and the need for qualified workers, while included, was ranked lowest. The only difference was that poor infrastructure was rated as more of a problem in that study than in this current one. Although the 1995 Survey found that only 3% of informal sector activities reported having received assistance from anyone, when they had received assistance, it tended to be in the form of training, either technical or managerial/commercial.

- ∇ Only just over 50% of the owners/managers rated the skill of being able to train other people highly. Where they did rate it highly, they generally thought they had the skill.

### **6.3 CONCLUSIONS**

For an apprenticeship to work, there must be sufficient work for the apprentices, the owner/manager must have enough skill to teach the apprentice, and there must be tools for the apprentice to use. It is clear that this is not the situation in many, probably most, of the businesses in this survey.

In most instances, the traditional apprenticeship practice in the trades investigated in the study is rudimentary and quite fragile, if existent at all, and it does not provide a solid base for the development of an intervention programme. Any attempt to intervene directly in the practice may well do more harm than good, and create yet another supply-driven, dependency-inducing training programme. Where the practice is working, it should be left to get on with it. Where it is not, this is not a useful point at which to kick-start the process as this would contravene the principles of non-interference and what the ISTAR, Zimbabwe, project refers to as the 10/90 principle which demands that a 10% investment from a development project be met with a 90% investment from beneficiaries.

However, the study has highlighted the considerable lack of skills among the owners/managers, as well as a lack of productivity. Notoriously, informal sector enterprises suffer from too much “me-too-ism”, which results in a lack of innovation and leads to saturation levels being reached in many of the industries. The more effective the “master craftsmen” who train the apprentices are, the better the traditional practice will be, and, if new niche areas for service or product delivery are developed, then more opportunities for traditional apprenticeship will emerge. We pick up on these options again in the final Section.

## SECTION 7: WHERE TO?

Any decisions by GTZ/VETA should be based on the understanding that interventions in the informal sector cannot be successful if they are not part of an overall strategy aimed at strengthening that sector. Training on its own can have only very limited value. In order for a training intervention to have a maximum impact, there would also need to be:

- ∇ Clear government policy, deregulation, minimising of official corruption, the development of better land usage policies and of improved infrastructure;
- ∇ Improved access to micro-financing, including possibilities such as tool hire-to-buy schemes;
- ∇ An accelerated improvement in the economy overall, and the development of linkages between the formal and informal sectors.

While these clearly do not fall directly into the ambit of the GTZ/VETA mandate, GTZ/VETA should be actively and strategically lobbying and doing advocacy work to bring such improvements about.

If there is to be any training intervention, it needs to be at the level of the “master”, on the premise that better craft/trade and business skills will make him or her more productive, able to produce better quality products or services, and, therefore, to “grow” the business. This should, indirectly, but quite forcefully, impact on the traditional apprenticeship practice. A “trickle down” effect is a more likely scenario than a “trickle up” effect!

Any training interventions need to be based on principles of:

- ∇ flexibility;
- ∇ demand; and
- ∇ sustainability.

Flexibility includes the ability to provide relevant training with different content, in different forms, and in different contexts. It means seeking out training niches where there is a demand and, possibly, even introducing potential entrepreneurs to the niches identified and their potential, in order to create a market-related demand. It involves encouraging the complete revamping of existing institutions so that they too can be flexible, and their teachers, curricula and assessment methods are relevant, appropriate and cost-effective. Certification and accreditation should also be appropriate and useful, rather than regulation-bound, cumbersome and costly. A certificate of specified competence may well be all an informal sector enterprise owner needs to impress customers and prove his/her credentials.

Demand includes a strong market-orientation, both in terms of training offered, and in terms of the way the training is offered. In this area, the would-be service provider faces two key challenges: convincing informal sector participants that training should be a priority for them, and addressing the issue of cost. The two are closely related. People will pay for something when they think they need it and that it has value. When training is offered free, it is automatically devalued. Yet, in order to convince informal sector participants that something is useful, it may be necessary to offer it either free, or highly subsidised. A further complication is that, once a service has been offered free, it is difficult to introduce a charge for later intakes. As we said earlier in the report, innovative ways need to be found for tackling this dilemma. We suggested a training raffle or a competition. The latter is something which would probably fit better with the seriousness of VETA's purpose. It might be organised around the concept of a "masterpiece" as this term was used in the craft apprenticeship days of the past. "Masters" in a particular trade, or grouping of trades, could be asked to produce such a piece and those who produced the 20 top products could be invited to attend a short training programme dealing with some of the problem issues identified by informal sector owners and managers. The programme would have to be very good, with the potential to have some immediate impact on the business practice of the participants. It could then be advertised and "sold" more widely. This is the sort of "event" which VETA, as a training regulator, could organise in conjunction with a service provider.

The issue of whether training should be subsidised at all is a difficult one, and speaks directly to the issue of sustainability. Few, if any, countries in sub-Saharan Africa can afford to provide extensive subsidies for training indefinitely. Even where, as in Tanzania, there is a skills levy from the formal sector which can be drawn on for informal sector training, it can never hope to meet all the training needs of both the formal and informal sectors. Given how little most people believe they could pay for training, subsidisation may be unavoidable, but the intention should always be to keep the costs of the training offered as low as possible (which means focused and basic, but not poor quality), and the amount of the subsidy as little as possible. More basic courses should be more subsidised than more advanced courses, on the premise that, if the training is successful, then participants will be increasingly able to

**Traditional Apprenticeship Survey/Dar Es Salaam Sept 1999**

pay more, and will, as well, have discovered the value of training. This, at least, creates the possibility of sustainability in the provision of training programmes.

With regard, therefore, to the Terms of Reference for this particular study, we recommend the following:

- 1 That VETA not interfere in the traditional apprenticeship practice in Dar es Salaam at this time, but rather focus on the “master” level in its training interventions.
- 2 That VETA encourage a culture of productivity and quality in the informal sector by becoming a promoter and endorser of excellence in the sector. This could be done as suggested above, through the presentation of “VETA awards”, through the development and dissemination of “success” case studies of the informal sector, and through other ways that are innovative and appropriate to the sector. This process should be informed by VETA’s concerns with gender.
- 3 That VETA commission the investigation of potential informal sector trade niches, and, on the basis of the findings of such an investigation, form partnerships with other service providers to offer training to would-be entrepreneurs in these niche areas. Concerns about gender should inform this investigation. Such training must include entrepreneurial orientation and business skills. Selection of candidates for such training must be based on entrepreneurial potential, and success must be measured in terms of successful self-employment.
- 4 That VETA develop a system of accreditation for informal courses offered in the informal sector. This system should be based on acknowledging competencies learned at the most basic level, as well as more advanced competencies. It could probably be done using different coloured certificates to represent different levels. The certificates would be issued in the name of both VETA and the training provider. A certificate could be for the acquisition of one competency or a set of competencies. Training providers would need to develop competency-based courses, with built in practical assessment processes, for accreditation by VETA. This would also enable VETA to develop a data base of who offers what, and to help to rationalise the provision of training to the informal sector. This in itself would help to make the provision of training to the sector more cost-effective.
- 5 That VETA identify providers of services other than training that would be of use to informal sector enterprise owners and form networks with them so that the potential exists to offer informal sector entrepreneurs a “package” of services, including access to micro credit, small business advisory services, and marketing support. Experience has shown that women often need special support, particularly when they are working in non-traditional trades, and this needs to be taken into account in the networking process.

- 6 That VETA lobby proactively for legislative and regulatory changes that will make the informal sector a more entrepreneur-friendly environment.

We are very aware of the concerns expressed by the respondents about the expectation that they will give input into processes of this nature and then hear nothing about the findings nor benefit in any way from follow up. This is not a simple issue to address. We suggest, however, that should VETA decide to follow up on any of the recommendations made, they link services they offer to such entrepreneurs directly to the surveying process.

**Nell and Shapiro cc  
October 1999**



Nell and Shapiro cc	1998	Adding Value: A formative casestudy of the Traditional Apprenticeship Programme (TAP) of the Informal Sector Training and Resources Network (ISTARN) Masvingo Province, Zimbabwe (May)
VETA	1999	A Consolidated Report on Skills Development for the Informal Sector, Dar es Salaam (June)
Wangwe, S M	1999	Micro and Small Enterprise Development and Employment Implications: Review of Current Status and Prospects, ILO/Ministry of Labour and Youth Department/Economic and Social Research Foundation, National Round Table Meeting on Employment Policy, Dar es Salaam (May)
Wangwe, S M Tsikata, Y M	1999	Macroeconomic Developments and Employment in Tanzania, ILO/Ministry of Labour and Youth Department/Economic and Social Research Foundation, National Round Table Meeting on Employment Policy, Dar es Salaam (May)

**Traditional Apprenticeship Survey/Dar Es Salaam Sept 1999**

# QUESTIONNAIRE FOR STUDY OF TRADITIONAL APPRENTICESHIP

**NB: THE INTERVIEWEE MUST BE THE OWNER OR MANAGER OF THE BUSINESS!!!!**

## Purpose of study:

The purpose of this study is to find out whether small (informal) businesses enter into agreements to pass on the skills of the trade to trainees (traditional apprentices).

For the purposes of this study, the informal sector comprises own-account entrepreneurs as well as paid employees, apprentices and family helpers in the small business. The size of an informal enterprise is limited to 5 employees and less with the exception of manufacturing and construction enterprises where the maximum number can be up to 10 paid employees.

Date: \_\_\_\_\_ Name of Interviewer: \_\_\_\_\_

Specific district of operation:

- 90-1 Temeke
- 90-2 Ilala
- 90-3 Kinondoni

Name of person interviewed: \_\_\_\_\_

Address of business: \_\_\_\_\_

## QUESTIONS

1 What is your position in this business? Are you the

- 91-1 Owner
- 91-2 Manager

2 What is the main trade of this business?

- |                          |                                    |
|--------------------------|------------------------------------|
| 92-1 Masonry             | 92-2 Catering                      |
| 92-3 Tailoring           | 92-4 Welding and metal fabrication |
| 92-5 Car mechanics       | 92-6 Carpentry                     |
| 92-7 Children's day care | 92-8 Hairdressing                  |

3 Is this business a member of any associations?

- 93-1 None
- 93-2 Business
- 93-3 Religious
- 93-4 Savings Clubs
- 93-5 Other (Specify) \_\_\_\_\_

Traditional Apprenticeship Survey/Dar Es Salaam Sept 1999



4 How long has this business been in existence?

94-1 Under 1 year

94-2 1 - 3 years

94-3 4 - 5 years

94-4 Over 5 years

5 Is the business owned by:

95-1 A family

95-2 One person

95-3 A group of people (explain)

95-4 Other (specify)

---

6 How long has/have the owner/s lived in Dar Es Salaam?

96-1 Always

96-2 Over 5 years

96-3 Under 5 years

96-4 Does not live in Dar Es Salaam

7 What is/are the sex/es of the owner/s?

97-1 Male

97-2 Female

97-3 Both

97-4 Not applicable

8 **(Observation)** If person interviewed is not the owner, what is his/her sex?

98-1 Male

98-2 Female

9 What is your age (the person being interviewed)?

99-1 Under 18

99-2 18 - 24

99-3 25 - 29

99-4 30 - 39

- 9<sub>9-5</sub> 40 - 49
- 9<sub>9-6</sub> Over 50

10 What is the highest level of education you have attained?

- 9<sub>10a-1</sub> None
- 9<sub>10a-2</sub> Incomplete primary
- 9<sub>10a-3</sub> Complete primary
- 9<sub>10a-4</sub> Incomplete O Level
- 9<sub>10a-5</sub> Complete O Level
- 9<sub>10a-6</sub> Incomplete A Level
- 9<sub>10a-7</sub> Complete A Level
- 9<sub>10a-8</sub> Complete high learning institution
- 9<sub>10a-9</sub> Incomplete high learning institution
- 9<sub>10a-10</sub> Other qualifications

Specify: \_\_\_\_\_

Say: This is a study about people who are being trained in small businesses. When we say “trained” we mean situations where the trainee and/or his family and the business owner or manager agree together that the skills of the business will be passed on to the trainee under certain conditions. We call the trainee in this situation an “apprentice” or “mwanafunzi”.

11 How many apprentices do you have in this business right now? !\_\_\_!11-?

11a What is/are their ages?

- !\_\_\_!11a-1 Under 10 years of age
- !\_\_\_!11a-2 11 - 13 years of age
- !\_\_\_!11a-3 14 - 16 years of age
- !\_\_\_!11a-4 17 - 18 years of age
- !\_\_\_!11a-5 Over 19 years of age

If he has had no apprentices, go direct to question 14.

12 Are any of them related to you or the owner?

- 9<sub>12-1</sub> Yes
- 9<sub>12-2</sub> No

13 If yes, how many? !\_\_\_!13-?

14 How many employees (excluding apprentices) work in this business at the moment, and how many worked here two years ago?

	Now	2 years ago
Permanent workers	!___!14a-1	!___!14b-1
Casual labourers	!___!14a-2	!___!14b-2

Family helpers	!___! 14a-3	!___! 14b-3
Others (specify)	!___! 14a-4	!___! 14b-4

---

15 All in all, how many apprentices have you had in this business in the last five years, including those you now have?

!\_\_\_! 15-?

If he has had no apprentices, go direct to question 19.

16 If yes, how many were

Male !\_\_\_! 16a-?

Female !\_\_\_! 16b-?

17 Of the above, how many of those apprentices

**Male Female**

Are still in apprenticeship?	!___! 17a-1	!___! 17b-1
Finished their apprenticeship?	!___! 17a-2	!___! 17b-2
Were employed in this business after apprenticeship?	!___! 17a-3	!___! 17b-3
Are still working in the business today?	!___! 17a-4	!___! 17b-4
Are now unemployed?	!___! 17a-5	!___! 17b-5
Set up their own business in a similar trade?	!___! 17a-6	!___! 17b-6
Set up their own business in a different trade?	!___! 17a-7	!___! 17b-7
Found jobs in a formal business in the same trade?	!___! 17a-8	!___! 17b-8
Found jobs in an informal business in the same trade?	!___! 17a-9	!___! 17b-9
Found jobs in an informal business in a different trade?	!___! 17a-10	!___! 17b-10

18 If you have apprentices, or have had apprentices in the past, why do you/did you choose to do so?

918-1 to get extra help

918-2 to help young people get a start in life

918-3 to expand the business

918-4 to get training fees

918-5 kinship

918-6 other reasons (specify) \_\_\_\_\_

19 If the business has no apprentices at the moment, would you be willing to take on apprentices in the future?

- 919-1 Yes  
919-2 No

20 (If no) Why would you not be prepared to take on apprentices?

- 920-1 not customary in this trade  
920-2 difficult to find  
920-3 too much trouble  
920-4 no need  
920-5 just started the business  
920-6 they would become potential competitors  
920-7 too costly  
920-8 other (specify) \_\_\_\_\_

21 In your enterprise, which of these skills is: (Put number in column A.)  
1 very important; 2 important; 3 not important at all

A		B	
!___!21-1	calculating and numeracy	!___!22-1	
!___!21-2	writing and reading	!___!22-2	
!___!21-3	negotiating with suppliers and customers	!___!22-3	
!___!21-4	training people	!___!22-4	
!___!21-5	applying for and managing credit	!___!22-5	
!___!21-6	advertising and presentation of products	!___!22-6	
!___!21-7	keeping written accounts	!___!22-7	
!___!21-8	costing the product	!___!22-8	
!___!21-9	use of machines	!___!22-9	
!___!21-10	use of materials	!___!22-10	
!___!21-11	repairing the machines	!___!22-11	
!___!21-12	organising production	!___!22-12	
!___!21-13	other	!___!22-13	

22 Which of the skills do you have? (Tick column B.)

23 How did you mainly acquire this skill? (Put number in column A.)

- 1 at school; 2 at a training course; 3 during apprenticeship at a large business;  
4 during apprenticeship in a business like your own; 5 on the job; 6 other

A		B	
!___!23-1	calculating and numeracy	!___!24-1	
!___!23-2	writing and reading	!___!24-3	
!___!23-3	negotiating with suppliers and customers	!___!24-3	
!___!23-4	training people	!___!24-4	
!___!23-5	applying for and managing credit	!___!24-5	
!___!23-6	advertising and presentation of products	!___!24-6	
!___!23-7	keeping written accounts	!___!24-7	
!___!23-8	costing the product	!___!24-8	
!___!23-9	use of machines	!___!24-9	

<input type="checkbox"/> !23-10	use of materials	<input type="checkbox"/> !24-10
<input type="checkbox"/> !23-11	repairing the machines	<input type="checkbox"/> !24-11
<input type="checkbox"/> !23-12	organising production	<input type="checkbox"/> !24-12
<input type="checkbox"/> !23-13	other	<input type="checkbox"/> !24-13

If the person has/had no apprentices in the future, go straight to question 27

24 Which of these skills must your apprentice have before you will take him into apprenticeship? (Tick column B.)

25 How does/did your apprentice mainly acquire this skill? (Tick column A.)

1 at school; 2 at a training course; 3 during apprenticeship at a large business;  
4 during apprenticeship in a business like your own; 5 on the job; 6 other

A		B
<input type="checkbox"/> !25-1	calculating numeracy	<input type="checkbox"/> !26-1
<input type="checkbox"/> !25-2	writing reading	<input type="checkbox"/> !26-2
<input type="checkbox"/> !25-3	negotiating with suppliers and customers	<input type="checkbox"/> !26-3
<input type="checkbox"/> !25-4	training people	<input type="checkbox"/> !26-4
<input type="checkbox"/> !25-5	applying for and managing credit	<input type="checkbox"/> !26-5
<input type="checkbox"/> !25-6	advertising and presentation of products	<input type="checkbox"/> !26-6
<input type="checkbox"/> !25-7	keeping written accounts	<input type="checkbox"/> !26-7
<input type="checkbox"/> !25-8	costing the product	<input type="checkbox"/> !26-8
<input type="checkbox"/> !25-9	use of machines	<input type="checkbox"/> !26-9
<input type="checkbox"/> !25-10	use of materials	<input type="checkbox"/> !26-10
<input type="checkbox"/> !25-11	repairing the machines	<input type="checkbox"/> !26-11
<input type="checkbox"/> !25-12	organising production	<input type="checkbox"/> !26-12
<input type="checkbox"/> !25-13	other	<input type="checkbox"/> !26-13

26 Which of these skills do/did you teach your apprentice? (Tick in column B.)

27 Now, looking forward, is there anything, related to your current activity that **you** would like to learn or to improve? If so, what?

- 927-1 Craft skills
- 927-2 Management skills
- 927-3 Finance and accounts
- 927-4 Marketing skills
- 927-5 Literacy/numeracy skills
- 927-6 None
- 927-7 Other

If the person has/had no apprentices, go straight to question 30a and then 31a.

28 Now, looking forward, is there anything, related to your current activity that you would like **your apprentice** to learn or to improve? If so, what?

- 928-1 Craft skills
  - 928-2 Management skills
  - 928-3 Finance and accounts
  - 928-4 Marketing skills
  - 928-5 Literacy/numeracy skills
  - 928-6 None
  - 928-7 Other
- 
- 

29 Would you be prepared to send your apprentice to a training course?

- 929-1 Yes
- 929-2 No

30 How much would you be prepared to pay for a training course attended by

- a you
  - b your apprentice?
- | a                             | b                             |
|-------------------------------|-------------------------------|
| You                           | Your apprentice               |
| ! _____ Tsh! <sup>30a-?</sup> | ! _____ Tsh! <sup>30b-?</sup> |

31 Which of the following reasons describes best why

- a you
  - b your apprentice/s
- haven't yet undertaken such training?

- | a      | b                                       |
|--------|---|
| 931a-1 | 931b-1 No such training available       |
| 931a-2 | 931b-2 No time for training             |
| 931a-3 | 931b-3 Don't have entry qualifications  |
| 931a-4 | 931b-4 Too far away                     |
| 931a-5 | 931b-5 At the wrong hours               |
| 931a-6 | 931b-6 Too costly/financial constraints |
| 931a-7 | 931b-7 No reason at all                 |

931a-8 931b-8 Other (please specify) \_\_\_\_\_

**If the person has/had no apprentices, go straight to question 40.**

32 How long does it take for an apprentice to complete his/her apprenticeship in your business?

- 932-1 Under 3 months
- 932-2 3 - 6 months
- 932-3 6 - 9 months
- 932-4 9 - 12 months
- 932-5 1 - 2 years
- 932-6 3 - 5 years
- 932-7 More than 5 years

33 How long does it take for an apprentice to learn the skills he/she needs to fulfil the workplace requirements independently?

- 933-1 3 - 6 months
- 933-2 6 - 9 months
- 933-3 9 - 12 months
- 933-4 1 - 2 years
- 933-5 Over 2 years

34 What is required to finish the apprenticeship?

- 934-1 Fixed time schedule
- 934-2 Skill test
- 934-3 Money/gift
- 934-4 Other (Please specify): \_\_\_\_\_

35 What agreements, if any, did you enter into with the apprentice/his or her family for the training?

- 935-1 Verbal agreement
- 935-2 Written agreement
- 935-3 No agreement
- 935-4 Other (Specify) \_\_\_\_\_

36 What contribution/s does/has an apprentice make/made to you for acquiring skills in this enterprise?

**Traditional Apprenticeship Survey/Dar Es Salaam Sept 1999**

- 936-1 Contributions of materials (specify) \_\_\_\_\_
- 936-2 Payment in cash (state the amount) \_\_\_\_\_
- 936-3 Bondage (period) \_\_\_\_\_
- 936-4 No contributions \_\_\_\_\_
- 936-5 Others (specify) \_\_\_\_\_

37 What do/did you give your apprentice whilst he/she is in training at this enterprise?

- 937-1 Shelter \_\_\_\_\_
- 937-2 Food \_\_\_\_\_
- 937-3 Payment in cash (state the amount) \_\_\_\_\_
- 937-4 Nothing \_\_\_\_\_
- 937-5 Other (specify) \_\_\_\_\_

38 What else is/was included in the agreement?

- 938-1 Duration of training \_\_\_\_\_
- 938-2 Certification \_\_\_\_\_
- 938-3 Working hours \_\_\_\_\_
- 938-4 Holidays \_\_\_\_\_
- 938-5 Health and safety provisions \_\_\_\_\_
- 938-6 Other (Specify) \_\_\_\_\_

39 What factor is/has been most important to you when selecting an apprentice?

- 939-1 Money offered by apprentice \_\_\_\_\_
  - 939-2 Kinship and family ties \_\_\_\_\_
  - 939-3 Level of education of candidate \_\_\_\_\_
  - 939-4 Previous work experience of candidate \_\_\_\_\_
  - 939-5 Trustworthiness of candidate \_\_\_\_\_
  - 939-6 Aptitude for the work \_\_\_\_\_
  - 939-7 Age \_\_\_\_\_
  - 939-8 Other \_\_\_\_\_
- 

40 From your knowledge, how long has your trade or type of business existed in this market?

- 940-1 0 - 5 years \_\_\_\_\_
- 940-2 6 - 10 years \_\_\_\_\_
- 940-3 Over 10 years \_\_\_\_\_



940-4 Don't know

41 Do you use electrical machines in your business?

941-1 Yes

941-2 No

42 Is there

a water

b electricity

on site?

<b>a</b>	<b>b</b>
<b>Water</b>	<b>Electricity</b>

942a-1	942b-1	Yes
--------	--------	-----

942a-1	942b-2	No
--------	--------	----

43 Is there sufficient demand for the products or services of the business?

943-1 Yes

943-2 No

943-3 Fluctuates/seasonal/sometimes

943-4 Don't know

44 (If no) Why not?

---

45 Has your business expanded over the last two years?

945-1 Yes

945-2 No

945-3 Don't know

945-4 This is a new business

46 Question removed.

47 Which of the following problems were for you at the start

1 very difficult; 2 difficult; 3 not difficult at all

!\_\_\_!47-1 Finding a plot

!\_\_\_!47-2 Infrastructure (roads, water, toilets, telephones, etc.)

- !\_\_\_!47-3      Financing
- !\_\_\_!47-4      Tools, machines
- !\_\_\_!47-5      Raw material
- !\_\_\_!47-6      Marketing
- !\_\_\_!47-7      Advice
- !\_\_\_!47-8      Skills/know-how
- !\_\_\_!47-9      License/registration, etc
- !\_\_\_!47-10     Informal relations
- !\_\_\_!47-11     Other

Please specify: \_\_\_\_\_

48 Have these problems changed?

- 948-1    Yes
- 948-2    No
- 948-3    Don't know

49 Question removed.

50 Which of the following problems are today  
 1      very difficult; 2      difficult;      3      not difficult at all

- !\_\_\_!50-1      Finding a plot
- !\_\_\_!50-2      Infrastructure (roads, water, toilets, telephones, etc)
- !\_\_\_!50-3      Financing
- !\_\_\_!50-4      Tools, machines
- !\_\_\_!50-5      Raw material
- !\_\_\_!50-6      Marketing
- !\_\_\_!50-7      Advice
- !\_\_\_!50-8      Skills/know-how
- !\_\_\_!50-9      License/registration, etc
- !\_\_\_!50-10     Informal relations
- !\_\_\_!50-11     Other

Please specify: \_\_\_\_\_

Say: Thank you very much for giving me your time and co-operating in this study.

How long did this interview take?    !        mins!

## OBSERVATIONS BY THE INTERVIEWER

- 51 Give a brief description of the business - what is the business doing/producing? What is lacking in terms of infrastructure or equipment? Please make any other observations you wish to make.

---

---

---

---

- 52 Was the business situated

- 952-1 In a market area  
952-2 In a residential backyard  
952-3 On the sidewalks of a main street  
952-4 Other (Specify) \_\_\_\_\_

- 53 Did you believe that the business performance of the enterprise was:

- 953-1 Not profitable  
953-2 Profitable  
953-3 Very profitable

- 54 Did the enterprise appear to be busy?

- 954-1 Yes  
954-2 No  
954-3 Don't know/can't tell

- 55 What indicators did you see of this?

---

---

- 56 On a scale of 1 to 5, where 1 means "very willing" and 5 means "very unwilling", rate this business in terms of whether you, the interviewer, would be willing to purchase goods or services from it. Rating: !\_\_\_! 56?

- 57 Please make any other comments you would like to make.

---

---

---