VOCATIONAL EDUCATION TRAINING AUTHORITY (VETA)

LABOUR MARKET (TRAINEE) SURVEY FOR DAR ES SALAAM

(Final Draft Report)

BY

ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL RESEARCH FOUNDATION

Date 12 March 1999

TABLE	OF	CONTE	NTS

LIST	OF TA	ABLES	10		
ABB	REVIA	ATIONS	11		
ACK	NOWI	LEDGMENT	13		
EXE	CUTIV	E SUMMARY	14		
1.0	INT	RODUCTION, OBJECTIVES AND METHODOLOGY	1		
	1.1	Introduction			
	1.2	Objectives	3		
	1.3	Methodology			
		1.3.1 Research instruments			
		1.3.2 Sampling	5		
		1.3.3 The data base			
2.0	THE	E LABOUR MARKET AND VOCATIONAL TRAINING	7		
	2.1	Demography and Labour Market			
	2.2	Social Services	7		
	2.3	The State of the Labour Market	9		
	2.4	Formal Sector Employment	10		
	2.5	Informal Sector Employment	11		
	2.6	The Role of Vocational Training	13		
	2.7	The Role of Vocational and Education Training Authority (VETA)	14		
3.0	VO	CATIONAL EDUCATION	16		
	3.1	The Institutes	16		
	3.2	Distribution of Surveyed Trades by Type of Certificate Issued	19		
	3.3	Information Technology			
	3.4	Duration of Courses (in Months) by Type of Certificate Issued	25		
	3.5	Policy Recommendations for Vocational and Education Training			
		Providers/Sponsors			
4.0	PER	SONAL DATA	27		
	4.1	Age Distribution by Type of Certificate	27		
	4.2	Gender and Vocational Training			
	4.3	Marital Status of Students by Sex	30		
	4.4	Occupation of Parents by Type of Trainee Course			
	4.5	Policy Recommendations on VET Students and Potential Students			

5.0	ED	UCATIONAL AND OCCUPATIONAL EXPERIENCE	35
	5.1	Education Background of Trainee by Type of Course by Sex	35
	5.2	Vocational Education Background	
	5.3	Employment Status of Trainee	40
	5.4	Duration of Work by Sector of Employment	42
	5.5	Course Related to Occupation.	43
	5.6	Employment Status Prior to Entry	43
	5.7	Policy Strategies and Recommendations Relating to Education and Occupation	45
6.0	COU	JNSELING AND FEES	48
	6.1	On Whether Trainees Received any Counseling before Joining Vocational Training	48
	6.2	Reasons for Applying for a Course	51
	6.3	Fees	52
	6.4	Policy Strategies and Recommendations on Counseling and Fees	53
7.0	TRA	AINING ISSUES	55
	7.1	On Whether the Course of Training Met the Trainees' Expectations	55
	7.2	Whether the Training Provides the Skills and Know-how Necessary	
		for Self Employment	60
	7.3	Policy Strategies and Recommendations on Training Issues	62
8.0	TRA	AINEES' EXPECTATIONS	64
	8.1	Perceived Future Prospects of the Trainees	64
	8.2	Expectation of Getting a Job because of the Vocational Training	65
	8.3	Trainees Expectation of Wages	67
	8.4	Students Expecting Better Salary because of their Vocational Training	70
	8.5	Chances for Employment of Vocational Training Graduates in the	
		Dar es Salaam Labour Market	71
	8.6	Policy Recommendations on Trainee Perspectives	72
9.0	TRAINEES VIEWS		
	9.1	Major Problems Related to Training	76
	9.2	Suggestions for Course Improvement	78
	9.3	Improving Employment Opportunities	81
10.0	THE	E ROLE OF DSM-VETA, VET PROVIDERS AND ALL INTERESTED	
	PA	RTIES	83
		The Role of VETA	
	10.2	The Role of VET Providers in Dar es Salaam Region	84
	10.3	VET Curricula	85

	iv	
10.4	VET Trainees upon Graduation	85

11.0	CONCLUSIONS RECOMMENDATIONS AND POLICY IMPLICATIONS	86
	11.1 Alleviating Training and Employment problems	91
	11.2 In Conclusion.	94
REFEI	RENCES - Trainee Survey	96

LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1:	Tanzania's Social Indices	8
Table 3.1:	Vocational Institutes: Basic Characteristics	
Table 3.2:	Distribution of Surveyed Trades by Type of Certificate Issued	20
Table 3.3:	Sub-Trades	22
Table 3.4:	Trades and Sub-Trades Divisions	23
Table 3.5:	Duration of Courses (in Months) by Certificate Issued	25
Table 4.1:	Age Distribution by Type of Certificate by Sex	
Table 4.2:	Marital Status of Students by Sex	
Table 4.3:	Occupation of Parents by Type of Trainee Trades	
Table 4.4:	Occupation of Parents by Type of Trainee Trades	
Table 5.1:	Educational Background of Trainee by Size of Institute by Sex	35
Table 5.2:	Educational Background of Trainee by Type of Institute by Sex	
Table 5.3:	Educational Background of Trainee by Type of Course	
Table 5.4:	VETA Background of the Students by Size of Institute by Sex	
Table 5.5:	VETA Background of the Students by Type of Institute by Sex	
Table 5.6:	Employment Status of Trainee by Type of Institute by Sex	40
Table 5.7:	Employment Status of Trainee by Type of Institute by Sex	42
Table 5.8:	Duration of Work by Sector	43
Table 5.9:	Employment Status Immediately before Entering Training Centre by Sex	
Table 6.1:	Whether Trainee Received any Counselling before Joining Vocational	
	Training by Level of Magnitude and by Size of Institute	49
Table 6.2:	Reasons for Applying for a Course by Size of Institute	51
Table 6.3:	Reason for Applying for a Course by Type of Institute	51
Table 6.4:	Reasons for Applying for a Course by Sex	53
Table 7.1:	Whether the Courses/Training so far Received Meet the Trainees	
	Expectations by Types of Trades	56
Table 7.2:	Whether Courses/Training so far Received Met of the Trainees	
	Expectations by Type of Institute	57
Table 7.3:	Whether the Courses/Training so far Received Met Trainee Expectations	by Size of
	Institute	59
Table 7.4:	Whether the Course Training so far Received Met Trainee Expectations by	Criteria of
	Judgement	60
Table 7.5:	Whether the Training Provide Skills and Know-How Necessary for	
	Self-Employment by Type of Trade	61
Table 8.1:	Perceived Future Prospects of Trainee by Trade	65
Table 8.2:	Expectation of Getting a Job Because of Vocational Training Trades	66
Table 8.3:	Expected Range of Wages (Monthly Minimum Wage)	67
Table 8.4:	Expected Range of Wages (Monthly Fair Wage)	

	vii		
Table 8.5:	Expected Range of Wages (Top Monthly Wage)		
Table 8.6 :	Students Expecting better Salary because of their Vocational		
	Training by Course		

ABBREVIATIONS

AIDS	-	Acquired Immuno-Deficiency Syndrome
GDP	-	Gross Domestic Product
URT	-	United Republic of Tanzania
SAP	-	Strategic Action Plan (of VETA)
ESAURP	-	Eastern and Southern African Universities Research Programme
VET	-	Vocational Education Training
VETA	-	Vocational and Educational Training Authority
GTZ	-	Deutsche Geselleschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit
LMS	-	Labour Market Survey
NGO	-	Non Governmental Organization
ESRF	-	Economic and Social Research Foundation
URT	-	United Republic of Tanzania
HDI	-	Human Development Index
ILO	-	International Labour Organization
YMCA		- Young Men's Christian Association
HTTI	-	Hotel and Tourism Training Institute
O- Level	-	Ordinary Level of Secondary School Education
A- Level	-	Advanced Level of Secondary Education
SIDA	-	Swedish International Development Agency
CIDA	-	Canadian International Development Agency
MT	-	Mechanical Trades
ET	-	Electrical Trades
SI	-	Satisfaction Index
VTC	-	Vocational Training Centre
СТВА	-	Commercial Training and Business Administration
JASPA	-	Jobs and Skills Programme for Africa

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

Many people gave valuable contributions to enable the study's successful completion. This include the entire research team which was under the supervision of Professor Samuel Wangwe, the Executive Director of the Economic and Social Research Foundation (ESRF), with Dr. Haji Semboja, ESRF Research Fellow being the Principal Researcher. Other members of the research team were Mr. Godius Kahyarara also from ESRF and Mr. Kibendela of the labour market secretariat of Vocational and Education Training Authority (VETA). The research team was at different stages assisted by Mr. Jumanne Kalwani, Mr. Javed Mawji, and Mr. Adriano Mwihava.

Significant contribution to the trainee survey was also made by Dr. Hermann Schoenmeier, Consultant to *Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit* (GTZ) and VETA, Mr. Ewald Gold and Mr. Gernot Ritthaler both from GTZ whose supervision provided guidance to the survey. Also contributing to the success of the survey were the former Director General of VETA, Mr. Morgan Manyanga who provided the historical background of vocational training in Tanzania; Mr. Ngowi, the Director of Training at VETA, who provided notes on the Vocational Education and Training Act; and Mrs. Bernadetta Ndunguru, the Regional Director of VETA, who gave her observations on the current reforms and the way VETA should be moving in the new environment.

Also participating in the survey were Mr. Rhobi Chacha, Mr. Benedict Chitenje, Mr. Andrew Kitumbo, Mr. Deusdedith Joseph, Mr. Thomas Kyariga, Mr. Mkhomoi, Mr. Mwaijonga, Mr. Gambamala, Ms. Ellen, Ms. Maria Msangi, Ms. Kagungulu Mvungi, Ms. Eunice Urio, Ms. Tausi Kida, and Ms. Fortunate Songora. Our gratitude also goes to all heads of the organizations we surveyed as well as respondents who participated in the interviews during the survey. Although it has not been possible to mention all by names, their assistance was highly appreciated.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1.0 The Economic and Social Research Foundation (ESRF) was commissioned by the *Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit* (GTZ) to carry out a Labour Market Survey in Dar es Salaam on behalf of the Vocational and Education Training Authority (VETA). The objective of the study was the formulation of a consistent set of guidelines and operational strategies that would enable VETA to carry out its main function of providing training to the labour market participants as per the existing market requirements.

The specific target of the survey was to ensure that the training provided by VETA is basically demand driven and cost effective. The data and information of this LMS study have been collected, analysed and stored for the future tracer studies in Dar es Salaam.

2.0 Major Findings of the DSM-LMS Trainee Survey

2.1 The present new environment requires new skills

The characteristics and structure of Dar es Salaams labour market have been changing over time in response to changes in the country's economic management, political system and structure. Following the economic reforms adopted in the mid 1980s, the relative importance of the public sector as a source of wage employment has substantially declined. In addition, the entry of new firms in the market has resulted in the introduction of new production techniques and hence a demand for new skills. This calls for skill acquisition in new areas.

2.2 Social services poor

The demography, availability and quality of social services are factors influencing the type, quality and size of the labour force. The fast increasing population in Dar es Salaam region has resulted in a large labour force, but the low level of social services means they are mostly unskilled. This points to the need for better social services especially in the educational sphere.

2.3 Employers suspicious of VET graduates

It is difficult for students trained at vocational institutes to penetrate the formal labour market. Employers are suspicious of the quality of the qualifications that VET graduates purport to have even if they do have the qualifications. Frequently, the labour force is not trained in areas that there is a demand in, but in areas that there is already an excess of supply in. The educational institutes, in other words, are not dynamic in their response to the demands of the employers in the private sector. This calls for dynamicity of educational institutions in providing the appropriate skills/skills in demand. It also calls for improvements in the education offered by VET institutions, promotional campaigns and the development of partnerships between VET institutions and potential employers.

2.4 VET graduates poorly equipped for self-employment

Vocational education training has changed from being a "substitute" for general education for those who "fail" to proceed with secondary education (because there are relatively few secondary schools), i.e., it substitutes for secondary education, by being a "supplement" for many who already have secondary education who fail to get placement in colleges or institutions of higher learning (mainly due to poor grades). As a result, students in vocational education are mainly comprised of young people who have only completed secondary school and need to acquire some marketable skills as a way of obtaining employment. Of course, an alternative source of employment, for VET graduates who do not obtain employment, which could be an income generation source could be the informal sector. This calls for carefully selected curricula that provide high quality and marketable skills in both the formal and informal sectors.

2.5 A certain amount of gender discrimination exists

Vocational education is open to both males and females, although certain courses are earmarked for one type of sex. For example, nursing, handicraft and hotel and tourism courses were found to be mainly attended by female students, whereas mechanical trades, masonry, electrical and other technical trades had male students as the majority. This is not in accordance with the official policy of encouraging the equal representation of both sexes in as wide a variety of work as possible. This calls for educational campaigns to change the mind-set of the citizenry, most of whom are culturally Aindoctrinated≅ to believe that women are inherently weak(er) and/or less gifted and so simply cannot acquire the mentioned skills. To change this thinking will take time and will require Arevolution by evolution≅ (so to speak) for the young generation and retraining for the older generations.

2.6 Career choices among trainees not based on advice by professionals

There are several factors that influence the decision to undertake specific training. Among them are the following: the capacity and interest of the trainees labour market conditions such as wage and employment opportunities, the VET institutions on offer (the type of VET institutions, where they are located, training costs and finally, counseling.

Trainees received counseling mainly from parents, guardians and relatives who have little knowledge of the vocational training process, labour market trends, interests and capacity of the potential student. Families have a strong influence on the decisions of many young VET students. This calls for awareness campaigns that would sensitize parents on the need to give advise based a knowledge of the current demands of labour market. If these are not known to them, they should seek counseling from bureaus that should be established solely for providing career advice and seeking out employment opportunities for VET graduates (and well as graduates from other educational institutions).

2.7 Trainees lack work experience

The majority of the trainees had not worked before, and even of those who had worked, over 40 percent were undertaking courses not related to their previous work. This signifies a lack of work experience, which is important in vocational training especially in technical trades. This points to the need for practical training/work experience.

2.8 Tanzania is urbanizing fast: High employment potentials/ many business opportunities

The vast majority of respondents indicated that the economic activity of their parents was farming and they are from the rural areas. This emphasizes the speed with which Tanzania is urbanizing. Very few of those in vocational training were following their parents occupations. It is evident that most of those attending the vocational schools

are either immigrants from the rural areas themselves or the first generation of those born in the city. Their best chance of successful transition from rural to urban dwellers is in vocational training for private and informal sector jobs. This needs to be combined with the governments continued nurturing of the private sector to ensure employment opportunities. This calls for strategic planning in the kind of vocational education provided.

2.9 Constraints related to training exist

At present, there are problems related to training. The barriers for the trainees in the course of learning include the lack of sufficient teachers and other teaching related problems, and the fact that the medium of instruction (usually English) is not effective due to poor educational background on the part of the students, a shortage of training materials, textbooks, practical and other equipment/tools and insufficient duration of the courses to enable the acquisition of skills. This calls for a revamp of educational systems.

2.10 Fees considered high

Students generally complained about the cost of attending the schools. The fees are not affordable to many poor students. Many schools, particularly the Missionary ones, cover part of their costs through the selling of items produced by trainees such as tables, chairs and so on. It may be possible to extend this concept further afield: each vocational school should ask itself what service it can offer which would complement the training it can provide to the public. This calls, for example, the provision of soft loans, the setting up of scholarship funds for those who excel (as an incentive), and as an income generation source, small workshops, vegetable farms, and horticultural farms.

xiii

xiv

2.10 A wide demand-supply gap exists

A wide gap exists between the type, quality and quantity of skills demanded and those supplied in the Dar as Salaam labour market. The presence of unemployment in university and other graduates from high level learning institutions in the business sector has led to a situation where vocational training graduates are squeezed out of the market, as they have to compete with the former in non-technical areas. The vocational education provided needs to be adjusted in order to adequately prepare the workforce for the prevailing labour market conditions. Dialogue should be established between VET providers and (potential) employers.

2.11 Courses should be augmented by practical training to ensure excellence

The survey revealed that 45 percent of all trainees interviewed were taking courses with a duration of a maximum of one year. At least 46 percent were in courses lasting for two years maximum. This shows that over 90 percent of all trainees interviewed were expecting to complete their course in two years or less. This is adequate given the objectives of VET courses, background, capacity and interests of students, available resources and the needs of the Dar es Salaam region labour market. However, it calls for an intern or practical training period.

The needs of older trainees (who have family/jobs responsibilities and so cannot spend long periods in training programmes) should be considered. Thus a balance could be found between long and short courses, (e.g. in-service courses) to carter for trainees with some work experience should be developed in addition to the long-duration courses which carter to the needs of new-comers who lack any work experience. An apprenticeship periods/registration boards could also be set up to ensure excellence as is the case for (among others) accountants and engineers.

2.12 Computer training high in the list of demanded skills

Because of the speed with which information technology has developed and the speed with which economic, social and political reforms have occurred, a generation gap has emerged. It is reasonable to expect that many of the children of rural farmers will be operating computers.

DSM-VETA needs to be aware of this challenge and be able to respond to it. Given the flexibility and energy of young people, this challenge is by no means insurmountable. This, of course, then calls for educational campaigns which provide information and training in skills with a high market demand such as (e.g. computer skills).

These educational campaigns should focus on removing the generation gap by providing information on current labour market demands e.g. through radio or TV programmes.

2.13 VET trainees have poor educational backgrounds

The weak educational background hinders performance at vocational school. This was a problem found in all the institutions that participated in the survey. Most students found to have advanced secondary education were in electrical trades, information and

technology and motor rewinding. DSM-VETA therefore should consider that there are certain type of courses which are appropriate for trainees with a certain education backgrounds. This emphasizes the need for an integrated, demand-driven educational-system wide approach to training.

2.14 Trainees optimistic about the future

The majority (92%) of the trainees indicated they were very optimistic about the future. In all trades most trainees indicated that they thought the future will be better and that they would benefit from training 49 percent of all trainees were confident of finding a job related to their field. Some extremes however are notable in trades like mechanical, motor rewinding, and information and technology. In these trades the majority of trainees were sure of finding jobs in their fields of specialization. Again, this calls for educational campaigns on and points to the need for counseling bureaus to educate trainees on how to make the right career choices, based on a sound knowledge of a free market environment.

3.0 Policy Strategies and Recommendations

It should generally be recognized that DSM-VETA is responsible for following up the implementation of the existing policies on vocational training and education and the provision of

xv

any amendments where necessary. Therefore when it comes to, for example, regulating of vocational training centres by setting standards for different trades, DSM-VETA has another important role to play in ensuring that the provision of vocational education is effective. DSM-VETA needs to carefully monitor course quality and content to ensure high quality teaching and promote employer confidence in graduates from VET institutions.

xvi

Strategies to ensure the attainment of high quality graduates that satisfy market demands include the following:

3.1 Medium term to long term strategies

3.1.1 Establish/provide centres to act as sources of labour market information

In order to bring the market back into equilibrium, the flow of information must be stimulated. It is suggested that job centres and employment bureaus be established by the relevant ministry and VETA to allow easier access to information. This will have at least two positive effects on the labour market. Firstly, it will allow job seekers and

employee seekers to establish contact, and secondly, it will allow those contemplating training to make sure that the course they choose will provide them with skills that are needed in the market place, thus increasing their chances of employment. The government should establish job centres and employment bureaus for the Dar es Salaam region in order to stimulate the flow of supply and demand information about the labour market.

3.1.2 Remove educational background inadequacies

Variations in the educational level of incoming students should be minimized. There are two possible ways to do this: through setting minimum entrance qualifications or through having crash courses in key subject such as Maths, English and basic sciences for those who need it prior to the beginning of training. Intensive pre-training English and maths crash-programme should be introduced in vocational centres for trainees who have been identified to have unsatisfactory primary/secondary education. These need to be comprehensive and cost effective in terms of money and time.

3.1.3 Develop VET centres-private sector partnerships

VETA should do what it can to encourage small, medium and large sized institutes. Incentives should be used to promote private sector participation in VET. Large and medium sized institutes should expand the number, type and level of courses so as to cater for as many of the market=s demands as possible. This will increase the efficient utilization of the resources already available at VET institutes. VETA should facilitate and promote the establishment of vocational training institutes of all categories by district in order to encourage a competitive climate. Commercial VET providers should be encouraged, as should the introduction of courses in new areas such as information technology. The quality of primary and secondary education needs to be raised in order to provide a solid foundation for vocational schools to build on. Some vocational classes could be taught at primary and secondary school. These should be co-ordinated jointly by the Ministry of Education and DSM-VETA.

xvii

3.2.4 Provide possibility of practical experience

Having noted the lack of sufficient practical experience, it is proposed that DSM-VETA should devise a mechanism that will ensure the provision of vocational education for both in-service and pre-service. One of the possible solution could be to look at the possibility of introducing vocational courses in other education levels e.g. primary education, so as to equip the entering students with some basic knowledge.

3.2.5 Remove gender biases

On the aspect of gender discrimination, it is suggested that DSM-VETA programmes incorporate some gender-specific measures to ensure full participation of both sexes in as many vocational courses as possible. Integrate women's issues into all employment and vocational training issues as well as development plans. Women should also be involved in administrative responsibilities and in decision-making in vocational training issues. Educating a female is to educate the whole nation because women essentially bring up the family, thus their education, training, improvement of their productivity and income; and participation in decision making process in society should be encouraged.

3.2.6 Take measures to make attendance fees affordable

xviii

On high attendance fees, it is proposed that Government or other institution(s) provide loans to assist, and that this be extended to include helping find employment for vocational graduates. If fees are still prohibitively high, the government should consider use of low interest loans to facilitate access to quality training. Institutes should be more active in helping their graduates to find employment. DSM-VETA needs to step up awareness campaigns among members of the general public as DSM-VETA has an important role to play in counselling.

3.2 Short-term strategies/ Strategies for immediate implementation

3.2.1 Revise curricula to meet labour market demands by providing new skills

DSM-VETA is advised to revise its curricula in order to cope with the prevailing societal changes e.g. the expressed need for the 21st century of Science and Technology; need for quality labour, entrepreneurial skills, etc. There is a need for strong practical components in vocational training. This requires that students have access to relevant machinery and tools. More variation in courses needs to be encouraged in order to supply the variety of skills that the market requires. This includes higher levels of specialization and more varied curricula providing multiple-skills. The need for appropriate skills relating to self employment is also high.

3.2.2 Establish a monitoring mechanism to ensure quality in the training provided

It was noted that many new schools are being established in the private sector. DSM-VETA must be vigilant to ensure that quality is maintained. DSM-VETA has to ensure that both itself and the institutions under it are operated in a transparent and fair manner especially in as far as resource allocation is concerned. A competitive and active vocational training sector will encourage the cross-fertilization of ideas and concepts whilst stimulating the institutes to be cost effective and efficient. This growth and competition should be encouraged, and all providers given equal opportunity. Strong links need to be forged between DSM-VETA and the private sector.